



# SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING DEPARTMENT

---

Subject to: (Select only if applicable)

- |  |  |
|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Inclusionary Housing (Sec. 315)         | <input type="checkbox"/> First Source Hiring (Admin. Code) |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Jobs Housing Linkage Program (Sec. 313) | <input type="checkbox"/> Child Care Requirement (Sec. 314) |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Downtown Park Fee (Sec. 139)            | <input type="checkbox"/> Other                             |

1650 Mission St.  
Suite 400  
San Francisco,  
CA 94103-2479

Reception:  
**415.558.6378**

Fax:  
**415.558.6409**

Planning  
Information:  
**415.558.6377**

## Planning Commission Final Motion M-17639

HEARING DATE: JUNE 26, 2008

*Date:* June 19, 2008  
*Case No.:* **2007.1437CV**  
*Project Address:* **901 ALABAMA STREET**  
*Zoning:* RM-1 (Residential, Mixed)  
40-X Height and Bulk District  
*Block/Lot:* 4146/034  
*Project Sponsor:* Regan Martin, Architect  
Tom Eliot Fisch  
201 Post Street  
San Francisco, CA 94108  
*Staff Contact:* Tim Frye – (415) 575-6822  
[tim.frye@sfgov.org](mailto:tim.frye@sfgov.org)

**ADOPTING FINDINGS RELATING TO CONDITIONAL USE AUTHORIZATION PURSUANT TO SECTIONS 209.4 AND 303 OF THE PLANNING CODE TO ALLOW THE RENOVATION AND EXPANSION OF A COMMUNITY FACILITY WITHIN AN RM-1 (RESIDENTIAL, MIXED) DISTRICT AND A 40-X HEIGHT AND BULK DISTRICT.**

### PREAMBLE

On December 13, 2007 Tom Eliot Fisch (Project Sponsor) filed an application with the Department for Conditional Use Authorization under Planning Code Section 209.4 and 303 of the Planning Code to allow the expansion of a community facility within the RM-1 (Residential, Mixed) District and a 40-X Height and Bulk District.

On June 26, 2008, the Commission conducted a duly noticed public hearing at a regularly scheduled meeting on Conditional Use Application No. 2007.1437C.

The project was determined by the San Francisco Planning Department (hereinafter "Department") to be categorically exempt from environmental review. The Commission has reviewed and concurs with said determination.

The Commission has heard and considered the testimony presented to it at the public hearing and has further considered written materials and oral testimony presented on behalf of the applicant, Department staff, and other interested parties.

**MOVED**, that the Commission hereby authorizes the Conditional Use requested in Application No. 2007.1437C, subject to the conditions contained in "EXHIBIT A" of this motion, based on the following findings:

## **FINDINGS**

Having reviewed the materials identified in the preamble above, and having heard all testimony and arguments, this Commission finds, concludes, and determines as follows:

1. The above recitals are accurate and constitute findings of this Commission.
2. **Site Description and Present Use.** The project is located at the southeast corner of the intersection of Alabama and 21<sup>st</sup> Streets, Block 4146, Lot 034. The property is located within the RM-1 (Residential, Mixed) District with 40-X height and bulk district. The 9,997 square foot site is developed with a 14,500 square foot structure, constructed in 1927. The subject property is a corner lot, with approximately 100 feet of frontage on Alabama Street and 100 feet of frontage on 21<sup>st</sup> Street. The lot is approximately 100% covered by the subject building, with no rear yard. The site is occupied by the Boys & Girls Club of San Francisco.
3. **Surrounding Properties and Neighborhood.** The project site is located at the intersection of Alabama and 21<sup>st</sup> Streets. The project site is located in an RM-1 (Residential, Mixed) District within the Mission District. A mixture of single-family homes, multi-family flats, condominiums, and small neighborhood-serving retail establishments define the District. Buildings are generally from two to four-stories in height.
4. **Project Description.** The proposed project is to demolish the existing 6,300 square foot gymnasium and construct a new 6,580 square foot gymnasium and new main entrance. The new gymnasium structure will have outdoor recreation space on the roof. The project also proposes to restore the historic clubhouse fenestration and main entrance.
5. **Public Comment.** As of the date of this report, the Department has received no comments regarding the project.
6. **Planning Code Compliance:** The Commission finds that the project is consistent with the following relevant provisions of the Planning Code in the following manner:
  - A. **Height.** Section 260 of the Planning Code requires that all structures be no taller than the height prescribed in the subject height and bulk district. The proposed project is located in a 40-X height and bulk district

*The project is approximately 33' in height from grade to the parapet and complies with the height limit.*

- B. **Bulk.** Section 270 of the Planning Code limits the bulk of buildings and structures, and assigns maximum plan dimensions. The proposed project is located in a 40-X height and bulk district, with an "X" bulk control.

*Planning Code Section 270 does not regulate bulk dimensions for sites with "X" controls.*

- C. **Front Setback.** Section 132 of the Planning Code requires that the proposed project shall be set back to the average of the two adjacent front setbacks.

*There are no front setbacks adjacent to the project along 21<sup>st</sup> Street. The subject building is proposed to be built along the 21<sup>st</sup> Street property line and is compliant.*

- D. **Rear Yard Requirement in the RM-1 District.** Planning Code Section 134 states that the minimum rear yard depth shall be equal to 45 percent of the total depth of a lot in which it is situated, but in no case less than 25 feet.

*The project shall increase the square footage of the gymnasium building approximately 250 square feet and includes nearly 100% lot coverage. The project sponsor is seeking a variance from this requirement from the Zoning Administrator.*

- E. **Parking.** Planning Section 151 of the Planning Code requires off-street parking for every 200 square-feet of occupied floor area.

*The project proposes to reconstruct the existing gymnasium building with a net gain of 250 square feet. Given the incremental net gain in floor area; the project is not defined as a major alteration as related to off-street parking requirements. A major alteration is defined as work that would intensify the use into requiring an additional five off-street parking spaces. A strict reading of the Planning Code would require that 2 off-street parking spaces be provided to comply with the 250 square foot net gain from reconstruction of the gymnasium building. Considering the incremental square footage gained by the proposal, there is no off-street parking requirement for this project and the proposal complies with the intent of the off-street parking requirements of the Planning Code.*

- F. **Loading.** Section 152 of the Planning Code requires that any development between 10,001 and 60,000 in gross floor area provide one off-street freight and loading area.

*The proposed plan will add one off-street loading space for a van and is compliant. Notwithstanding the minor increase in square footage as part of the proposal, it is the determination of the Planning Department that an off-street loading space is not required as part of this project.*

- G. **Street Trees.** Section 143 of the Planning Code requires that a minimum of one tree of 15-gallon size for each 20 feet of frontage of the property along each street or alley shall be installed in the case of the construction of a new building.

*The existing street trees shall be protected during construction, and where required, new street trees will be planted in compliance with this Code requirement.*

- H. **Floor Area Ratio (FAR)** Planning Code Section 124 limits the building square footage to 1.8 square feet of building area for every 1 square foot of lot area, or approximately 17,995 square feet of building area for the subject site.

*The proposed FAR for the building will be approximately 1.5, which is allowable under the Code.*

7. **Planning Code Section 303** establishes criteria for the Planning Commission to consider when reviewing applications for Conditional Use approval. On balance, the project does comply with said criteria in that:

- A. The proposed new uses and building, at the size and intensity contemplated and at the proposed location, will provide a development that is necessary or desirable, and compatible with, the neighborhood or the community.

*The existing building is the original location of the San Francisco Boys Club (currently known as the Boys & Girls Clubs of San Francisco) dating back to 1928. The club is temporarily working out of Bryant Elementary School due to the inadequate conditions of the existing facility at 901 Alabama Street. This relocation has limited the ability to serve the local community. The proposed facility will replace the existing rear building and upgrade and rehabilitate the existing front building. The site will be restored and the services of the club will returned to the community.*

- B. The proposed project will not be detrimental to the health, safety, convenience or general welfare of persons residing or working in the vicinity. There are no features of the project that could be detrimental to the health, safety or convenience of those residing or working the area, in that:

- i. Nature of proposed site, including its size and shape, and the proposed size, shape and arrangement of structures;

*The new building has been designed for conformity with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for additions to historic buildings. The new structure shall be constructed to the same general proportions as the existing structure while providing the club with the amenities necessary to update the program and ensure the safety of their club members. The proposed facility will replace the existing rear building and upgrade and rehabilitate the existing front building.*

*The current structure almost covers the entire lot. The proposed design includes an outside activity area through the use of a roof top teaching garden/play area. At the street level the adjacent neighbors will benefit by the replacement of the existing sidewalks, addition of new plantings and trees, and by the general cleanup and maintenance of the site.*

- ii. The accessibility and traffic patterns for persons and vehicles, the type and volume of such traffic, and the adequacy of proposed off-street parking and loading;

*The use of this facility is being restored and will be maintained as it originally operated. The existing clubhouse currently has no parking on site. The proposed plan will add one off-street parking space for a van to be used for club activities. The club also proposes adding a white curb drop-off zone along 21st street to allow parents to drop-off and pickup children at the club without double parking and maintaining street parking for the neighborhood residents at all other times. The white zone required time will be as follows:*

*School year (after school) - 2:00 to 8:00*

*Summer (drop-off / pick-up) - 8:00 to 10:00 and 4:00 to 8:00.*

- iii. The safeguards afforded to prevent noxious or offensive emissions such as noise, glare, dust and odor;

*The proposed use is subject to the standard conditions of approval for new construction and outlined in Exhibit A. During the development of the project, the Project Sponsor has committed to following sustainable practices such as construction activity pollution prevention, water and energy efficiency, and recycling/waste management. Observing these practices would ensure that noxious fumes and dust are contained or eliminated during demolition, construction, and during the lifetime of the building.*

- iv. Treatment given, as appropriate, to such aspects as landscaping, screening, open spaces, parking and loading areas, service areas, lighting and signs;

*The proposed project will add one off-street parking space which will be developed as residential scale garage. Open space access for the club youth is being proposed via a roof top teaching garden and play area. The proposal also shall provided new trees long the street frontage of the property*

- C. That the use as proposed will comply with the applicable provisions of the Planning Code and will not adversely affect the General Plan.

*Pending the Zoning Administrator granting the requested rear yard variance, the project complies with all relevant requirements and standards of the Planning Code and is consistent with objectives and policies of the General Plan as detailed below.*

- 8. **General Plan Compliance.** The project is, on balance, consistent with the following Objectives and Policies of the General Plan:

## URBAN DESIGN ELEMENT OBJECTIVES AND POLICIES

### Objectives and Policies

**OBJECTIVE 1:**

EMPHASIS OF THE CHARACTERISTIC PATTERN WHICH GIVES TO THE CITY AND ITS NEIGHBORHOODS AN IMAGE, A SENSE OF PURPOSE AND A MEANS OR ORIENTATION.

**Policy 1.1:**

Promote harmony in the visual relationships and transitions between new and older buildings.

*The project proposes a new gymnasium structure for the historic San Francisco Boys & Girls Club that is in conformity with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for additions and new construction. The proposed project is contemporary in design through its use of materials, massing, scale, and details similar to those on the clubhouse building and that respect the characteristics of the neighborhood.*

**Policy 1.3:**

Recognize that buildings, when seen together, produce a total effect that characterizes the City and its districts.

*The project design expresses the character of the overall neighborhood; it is consistent with the historical pattern of development for this site and it respects and contributes to the overall streetscape of the neighborhood.*

**Policy 1.6:**

Relate the bulk of buildings to the prevailing scale of development to avoid an overwhelming or dominating appearance in new construction.

*The bulk of the project is consistent with the prevailing scale of development in the immediate neighborhood, especially along 21<sup>st</sup> Street. The new gymnasium structure is consistent with the massing and scale of the existing gymnasium and shall not appear dominating nor overwhelm the existing surrounding structures.*

**NEIGHBORHOOD ENVIRONMENT**

**Objectives and Policies**

**OBJECTIVE 1:**

TO PROVIDE A QUALITY LIVING ENVIRONMENT.

**Policy 1.2:**

Allow appropriate neighborhood-serving commercial activities in residential areas.

*The project shall return a neighborhood-serving community facility back to its historic location so that it may reopen with a number of amenities to improve the quality-of-life of its club members*

*and ensure their safety. It is located within a thriving residential neighborhood that is well served by public transit and experiences a high level of foot traffic.*

9. **Planning Code Section 101.1(b)** establishes eight priority-planning policies and requires review of permits for consistency with said policies. On balance, the project does comply with said policies in that:

- A. That existing neighborhood-serving retail uses be preserved and enhanced and future opportunities for resident employment in and ownership of such businesses be enhanced.

*The project shall return a neighborhood-serving community facility back to its historic location so that it may reopen with a number of amenities to improve the quality-of-life of its club members and ensure their safety.*

- B. That existing housing and neighborhood character be conserved and protected in order to preserve the cultural and economic diversity of our neighborhoods.

*The surrounding neighborhood would not be adversely affected by the proposed project.*

- C. That the City's supply of affordable housing be preserved and enhanced,

*No housing is removed for this project.*

- D. That commuter traffic not impede MUNI transit service or overburden our streets or neighborhood parking.

*The site is at Alabama and 21<sup>st</sup> Streets and is located in an area that is well served by transit. It is presumed that the most club members would commute by public transit or be dropped off by adults, thereby mitigating possible impacts on street parking. The club also proposes adding a white curb drop-off zone along 21st street to allow parents to drop-off and pickup children at the club without double parking, thereby maintaining street parking for the neighborhood residents at all other times.*

- E. That a diverse economic base be maintained by protecting our industrial and service sectors from displacement due to commercial office development, and that future opportunities for resident employment and ownership in these sectors be enhanced.

*The project will not displace any service or industry establishment. The project will not affect industrial or service sector uses or related employment opportunities. Ownership of industrial or service sector businesses will not be affected by this project.*

- F. That the City achieve the greatest possible preparedness to protect against injury and loss of life in an earthquake.

*The project is designed and will be constructed to conform to the structural and seismic safety requirements of the City Building Code. This proposal will not impact the property's ability to withstand an earthquake.*

- G. That landmarks and historic buildings be preserved.

*The new gymnasium structure for the historic San Francisco Boys & Girls Club is in conformity with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for additions and new construction. Through its compatible design and the rehabilitation of the historic windows and entrance to the clubhouse structure, the proposed project allows the historic resource to still convey its significance.*

- H. That our parks and open space and their access to sunlight and vistas be protected from development.

*The project will have no negative impact on existing parks and open spaces. The project does not have an impact on open spaces.*

10. The project is consistent with and would promote the general and specific purposes of the Code provided under Section 101.1(b) in that, as designed, the project would contribute to the character and stability of the neighborhood and would constitute a beneficial development.
11. The Commission hereby finds that approval of the Conditional Use authorization would promote the health, safety and welfare of the City.



**DECISION**

That based upon the Record, the submissions by the Applicant, the staff of the Department and other interested parties, the oral testimony presented to this Commission at the public hearings, and all other written materials submitted by all parties, the Commission hereby **APPROVES Conditional Use Application No. 2007.1437C** subject to the following conditions attached hereto as "EXHIBIT A" which is incorporated herein by reference as though fully set forth.

**APPEAL AND EFFECTIVE DATE OF MOTION: Any aggrieved person may appeal this Conditional Use Authorization to the Board of Supervisors within thirty (30) days after the date of this Motion No. M-17639. The effective date of this Motion shall be the date of this Motion if not appealed (After the 30-day period has expired) OR the date of the decision of the Board of Supervisors if appealed to the Board of Supervisors. For further information, please contact the Board of Supervisors at (415) 554-5184, City Hall, Room 244, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102.**

I hereby certify that the Planning Commission ADOPTED the foregoing Motion on August 09, 2007.

Linda Avery  
Commission Secretary

AYES: C. Olague, R. Miguel, M. Antonini, K. Moore, H. Sugaya, G. Gordon

NAYS:

ABSENT: W. Lee

ADOPTED: June 26, 2008

## Exhibit A

# Conditions of Approval

1. This authorization is for a Conditional Use Authorization under Planning Code Section 209.4 of the Planning Code to allow the expansion of a community facility within the RM-1 (Residential, Mixed) District and a 40-X Height and Bulk District., in general conformance with plans filed with the Application as received on December 13, 2007 and stamped "EXHIBIT B" included in the docket for **Case No. 2007.1437CV**, reviewed and approved by the Commission on June 26, 2008.
2. Violation of the conditions contained in this Motion or of any other provisions of the Planning Code may be subject to abatement procedures and fines up to \$500 a day in accordance with Planning Code Section 176.
3. Should monitoring of the Conditions of Approval contained in Exhibit A of this Motion be required, the Project Sponsor or successors shall pay fees as established in Planning Code Section 351(e)(1).
4. For the historic Boys & Girls Club Clubhouse portion of the project, the Project Sponsor shall submit all historic and replacement window and entrance details and specifications for review and approval by Planning Department Preservation Staff and an assigned Preservation Architect on the Landmarks Preservation Advisory Board. The details and specifications shall be submitted prior to issuance of site permit and shall illustrate all exterior profiles, with dimensions.
5. The property owner shall maintain the main entrance to the building and all sidewalks abutting the subject property in a clean condition. Such maintenance shall include, at a minimum, daily sweeping, litter pickup and disposal, and washing or steam cleaning of the main entrance and abutting sidewalks at least once each week.
6. The project shall appoint a Community Liaison Officer to address issues of concern to neighbors related to the operation of this project. The Project Sponsor shall report the name and telephone number of this Officer to the Zoning Administrator and the neighborhood for reference. The Applicant will keep the above parties apprised should a different staff liaison be designated.
7. The Project Sponsor shall assure the execution and recordation of the specified conditions as a Notice of Special Restrictions at the Office of the County Recorder / County Clerk.
8. Prior to the issuance of the Building Permit for the project the Zoning Administrator shall approve and order the recordation of a notice in the Official Records of the Recorder of the City and County of San Francisco for the premises (Assessor's 2083, Lot 001), which notice shall state

that construction has been authorized by and is subject to the conditions of this Motion. From time to time after the recordation of such notice, at the request of the project Sponsor, the Zoning Administrator shall affirm in writing the extent to which the conditions of this Motion have been satisfied.

9. The Project Sponsor shall submit a tree protection program by a certified arborist as part of the Building Permit application for review and approval prior to the for approval by Planning Department Preservation Staff for review and approval prior to issuance of site permit.
  
10. The Planning Commission may, in a public hearing, consider the revocation of this conditional use authorization if a site or building permit has not been issued within three (3) years of the date of the Motion approving the project. Once a site or building permit has been issued, construction must commence within the timeframe required by the Department of Building Inspection and be continued thenceforth diligently to completion. The Commission may also consider revoking this conditional use authorization if a permit for the project has been issued but is allowed to expire and more than three (3) years have passed since the Motion was approved. This authorization may be extended at the discretion of the Zoning Administrator only if the failure to issue a permit by the Department of Building Inspection is delayed by a City, state or federal agency or by appeal of the issuance of such permit.