



SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING DEPARTMENT

Subject to: (Select only if applicable)

- | | |
|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Inclusionary Housing (Sec. 315) | <input type="checkbox"/> First Source Hiring (Admin. Code) |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Jobs Housing Linkage Program (Sec. 313) | <input type="checkbox"/> Child Care Requirement (Sec. 314) |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Downtown Park Fee (Sec. 139) | <input type="checkbox"/> Other |

1650 Mission St.
Suite 400
San Francisco,
CA 94103-2479

Reception:
415.558.6378

Fax:
415.558.6409

Planning
Information:
415.558.6377

Planning Commission Motion No. 17539

Hearing Date: January 24, 2008
Case No.: 1999.536 C
Project Address: 855 SACRAMENTO STREET
Zoning: CR/NC (Chinatown Residential/Neighborhood Commercial)
65-A Height and Bulk District
Block/Lot: 0242/27
Project Sponsor: YMCA of San Francisco
855 Sacramento Street
San Francisco, CA 94105
Staff Contact: Angela Heitter-- (415) 558-6602
Angela.Heitter@sfgov.org

ADOPTING FINDINGS RELATING TO CONDITIONAL USE AUTHORIZATION PURSUANT TO SECTIONS 303, 121.3, 145.3, 254, 812.10, 812.11, and 812.14 OF THE PLANNING CODE TO ALLOW HEIGHT ABOVE 35 FEET, NEW CONSTRUCTION ON A SITE LARGER THAN 5,000 SQ. FT. AND STREET FRONTAGE LONGER THAN 50 FEET, ALL ASSOCIATED WITH THE CHINATOWN YMCA RENOVATION AND BUILDING ADDITION PROJECT, WITHIN THE CR/NC (CHINATOWN RESIDENTIAL/NEIGHBORHOOD COMMERCIAL) DISTRICT AND A 65-A HEIGHT AND BULK DISTRICT.

RECITALS

1. On September 23, 2005, Allan Low on behalf of the YMCA of San Francisco (project sponsor) filed an application with the Department for Conditional Use Authorization. That application was subsequently amended to modify the project description and request approvals under Planning Code sections 303, 121.3, 145.3, 254, 812.10, 812.11, and 812.14 to allow height above 35 feet, new construction on a site larger than 5,000 sq. ft and street frontage longer than 50 feet, all associated with the Chinatown YMCA Renovation and Building Addition Project, within the CR/NC (Chinatown Residential/Neighborhood Commercial) District and a 65-A Height and Bulk District.
2. On August 13, 1999, the project sponsor submitted an Environmental Evaluation Application, File No. 199.526 E. An Initial Study was published on July 14, 2001, a Draft EIR was published on March 23, 2002, and a public hearing on the adequacy of the Draft EIR was held on April 25, 2002. Subsequent to publication of the Draft EIR, the project sponsor revised the project description. On August 3, 2005, the project sponsor submitted the current project proposal to the

Planning Department. On December 9, 2006, the Planning Department published an Initial Study for the current project. On October 17, 2007, the Planning Department published the revised Draft Environmental Impact Report ("DEIR") for the project and published a Notice of Completion with respect thereto. On November 15, 2007, the Planning Commission conducted a duly noticed public hearing at a regularly scheduled meeting on the DEIR. The public comment period closed on November 30, 2007, and a Summary of Comments and Responses was published on January 10, 2008.

3. On January 24, 2008, the Planning Commission conducted a duly noticed public hearing at a regularly scheduled meeting on 1999.526 E and, by Motion No. 17538 determined that the Chinatown YMCA Renovation and Building Addition Project Final Environmental Impact Report (FEIR) reflects the independent judgment and analysis of the City and County of San Francisco, is adequate, accurate and objective, that the Comments and Responses contains no significant revisions to the DEIR, and certified the FEIR as in compliance with CEQA and the CEQA Guidelines.
4. On January 24, 2008, the Commission conducted a duly noticed public hearing at a regularly scheduled meeting on Conditional Use Application No. 1999.526 C.
5. The Commission has heard and considered the testimony presented to it at the public hearing and has further considered written materials and oral testimony presented on behalf of the applicant, Department staff, and other interested parties.
6. **MOVED**, that the Commission hereby authorizes the Conditional Use requested in Application No. 1999.526 C, as revised subject to the conditions contained in "EXHIBIT A" of this motion, based on the following findings:

FINDINGS

Having reviewed the materials identified in the preamble above, and having heard all testimony and arguments, this Commission finds, concludes, and determines as follows:

1. The above recitals are accurate and constitute findings of this Commission.
2. **Site Description.** The project is located in the Chinatown neighborhood at 855 Sacramento Street, mid-block on the south side of Sacramento Street between Stockton Street to the west and Grant Avenue to the east, Block 0242, Lot 027. The property is located within the CR/NC (Chinatown Residential/Neighborhood Commercial) District with 65-A height and bulk. The property is developed with the Chinatown YMCA building, a 25,950 sq. ft., three-story (45 feet) over partially below-grade ground floor, mixed-use structure. The existing building consists of health and fitness facilities and community rooms on the ground, first and second floors, and 21 residential and 10 tourist hotel rooms on the third floor. Due to the site's slope, the ground floor is fully above grade at the eastern edge of the building and fully below grade at the western edge. In addition to the YMCA building, the project site also includes two open areas: a 40-foot-wide paved courtyard along the eastern property line and an approximately 36-foot wide unpaved area in the property's southwest corner. Adjacent to the eastern courtyard along

Sacramento Street is a tile-roof gated entryway, which was part of the original entryway to the building and includes the courtyard stairs up to the ornamental doors on the existing building's east wall and first floor entrance. In 1997, to comply with the Americans with Disability Act (ADA) requirements, the primary building entry was moved from this gate to the current first floor building entrance off Sacramento Street.

3. **Surrounding Neighborhood.** The project site is located on Sacramento Street between Stockton Street and Grant Avenue. The project site vicinity is a mixed-use area composed primarily of residential and commercial land uses, including office, retail restaurants and bars, a church, hotel and parking lots. There are a variety of building types, sizes, and ages in the project block and in the vicinity. Land uses along the south side of Sacramento Street on the project block are primarily residential with some ground-floor retail. Adjacent to the project site to the west is a six-story, 12-unit residential building at 875 Sacramento Street and to the east is a four-story-mixed use building with 14 residential units on the upper three floors and ground floor commercial uses including office space, a hair salon, a tire store, an antique business, and martial arts studio. Parcels adjacent to the south of the project site primarily front California Street and include a seven-story brick office building and a private parking lot for about 30 cars, separated by Sabin Place, an approximately 21-foot-wide, dead-end alley. West of the parking lot and southwest of the project site is a seven-story, 60-unit apartment building. Other uses on the north side of Sacramento Street from the project block include the Chinese Playground, a three-story brick church building, and the three-story building on the northwest corner of the Sacramento Street and Grant Avenue intersection with ground floor commercial and the Gold Mountain Sagely Monastery on upper floors. Grant Avenue, east of the project site, comprises the heart of the Chinatown District and is lined with predominantly three-and four-story, mixed-use buildings with ground floor retail stores and residential or commercial uses above. Multi-unit residential buildings primarily occupy Sacramento Street west of Stockton Street. Other uses in this area include a neighborhood center, a residential hotel, and the Donaldina Cameron House, a social service agency.
4. **Project Description.** The project would renovate and reconfigure the interior of the existing building and construct two new additions: one to the east and a small addition to the rear of the building. The interior of the existing YMCA building would be renovated extensively. The ground floor would be converted into shower and locker facilities and mechanical space. The first and second floors would be converted to community service space. The 21 residential hotel rooms and the 10 tourist hotel rooms on the third floor would be renovated and reconfigured into 25 residential hotel rooms and related facilities, included upgraded bathrooms and a community kitchen.

The new "east wing" would be an approximately 40-foot-tall, 19,350 sq. ft. addition, to be constructed in the existing eastern courtyard and abutting the southern approximately two-thirds of the existing building's east wall, including the central bay. A portion of the east addition would have an approximately 40-foot setback above the ground floor that would form a fenced courtyard to be used as an outdoor play area. The main entrance would be through the restored ornate gate on the ground floor of the new addition. The existing entrance would serve as an emergency exit only. The proposed addition would be structurally independent of the

existing building but would be connected at the ground, first and second floors to the renovated existing building. The north portion of the building has been refined somewhat from the project description in the FEIR based on consultation with Planning Department staff. It has been reduced by a recess that allows public viewing of the northernmost ornate entry and windows at the first and second floors and from the street. Interior atriums have been added to provide non-public visual access to the balance of the central bay.

The "Sabin Place" rear addition is a four-story, approximately 32-foot-tall, 3,500 sq. ft. addition at the rear of the existing building and fronting Sabin Place. It would provide a secondary means of stair and elevator access to the building, including a direct second-floor entrance to the residential lobby. The improvements would include an approximately 300 sq. ft. common usable open space area off the lobby at the second floor along Sabin Place for the residents. A portion of the addition would add to the renovated locker room area at the ground floor.

5. **Public Comment.** During the comment period on the Draft EIR, the Department received testimony and correspondence from two current tenants in opposition to the project as it relates to temporary tenant relocation. It also received comments related to the historic resource aspects of the project.
6. **California Environmental Quality Act Compliance.** The Planning Commission has reviewed and considered the FEIR and hereby adopts the following findings:

A. **Alternatives.**

1. Reasons for selecting the project set forth in the project approvals. In approving the project, the Planning Commission has carefully considered the attributes and environmental effect of the project and the alternatives discussed in the FEIR. This consideration, along with consideration of the reports from the City staff, other materials and information in the record before the Planning Department and the Planning Commission, as well as public testimony, has resulted in certain refinements incorporated into the project. The project represents the combination of features which, in the opinion of the Planning Commission, most closely achieves the basic objectives set forth in the FEIR as follows:

- Overall objective: Develop a Chinatown Center for youth and youth services that will more than double the number of teens and youth currently served by the YMCA programs for after-school education, teen center activities, day camp, leadership training, sports, summer school, summer camp, civic and cultural activities, outreach youth fitness, and youth club activities. This key objective has the following components:
- New Aquatic Center. Build a new aquatic center that (i) allows every child in the greater Chinatown area (Chinatown, North Beach, Nob Hill and Russian Hill) the opportunity to learn how to swim; (ii) includes aquatic programs for youth, teens, families, adults and seniors; (iii) expands by approximately 200 percent the number of people the Chinatown YMCA can serve with aquatic programs; and (iv) includes a

state-of-the-art facility and aquatic programs and that will allow neighborhood youths to train for competitive swimming.

The project includes a new aquatic center that meets the foregoing objectives by including a new, state-of-the-art facility, with a competition pool including five lanes.

- New Wellness Center. Include adequate dedicated space for a modern wellness center that will have modern training and exercise equipment in a facility designed for health/fitness activities, featuring Asian holistic and health/wellness programs specifically designed for youth as well as adults in the Chinatown community.

The project meets this objective by providing adequate space (approximately 26,200 gsf) for a modern wellness center and associated programming.

- Expanded Community Center. Include a center for the community, its families, youth and adults to meet and socialize.

The project meets this objective by providing an approximately 14,700 gsf community center and associated programming.

- Larger Facility. Based on the forecasted program requirements, double the size of the existing recreation and community space.

The project meets this objective by providing an approximately 40,900 gsf of recreation and community space, as compared to 21,000 gsf with the existing facility.

- Financial Feasibility. Meet the above program objectives through a development plan that is financially feasible for the project sponsor in light of existing and potential funding sources.

The project meets this requirement. Largely in response to funding constraints, the project sponsor reduced the overall scope and expense of the project as compared to the 1999 proposed project in order to align with existing and potential funding sources. The total project budget is approximately \$19.1 million. Of this, \$12.2 million has been raised from private fundraising, about \$3.1 million is available through New Markets Tax Credits, and the YMCA will contribute about \$3.8 million. Given the limits of private fundraising and the importance in minimizing debt for this not-profit operation, the project cost is an important consideration in assessing program feasibility.

2. Alternatives rejected and reasons for rejection.

i. Alternative A: No Project. Alternative A, the "No Project Alternative," is rejected in favor of the project and is found infeasible for the following environmental, economic, legal and technological reasons. Alternative A would not be desirable nor meet the project sponsor's objectives. The implementation of this Alternative is a continuation of the existing conditions, characterized by

an existing YMCA building which is inadequate to provide the quantity or quality of program space to serve the community and continue to generate the revenue that the YMCA, as a non-profit organization, needs to survive. The combination of the physical constraints of its aging facility and changes in program needs requires the YMCA to make changes. The existing facilities are not only too small and improperly configured to accommodate the YMCA's needs, particularly as to the pool, wellness center, community center and recreation and community space, but are also in need of repairs and upgrades, including to heating, ventilation, electrical and plumbing systems. The existing condition does not provide the framework that the YMCA needs to deliver the wide variety of social, cultural, recreational and educational programs and services relied upon by Chinatown and the surrounding community.

ii. Alternative B: Renovation of Existing Building and Preservation of Exterior. Alternative B, Renovation of Existing Building and Preservation of Exterior, is rejected in favor of the project and is found infeasible for the following environmental, economic, legal and technological reasons. Unlike the project, this Alternative would not include the east wing building or the Sabin Place rear additions, and would provide little change to services. Since the renovation would result in significantly smaller recreational and community-serving spaces than with the project and would not include the new pool, it would not meet the objectives of building a new aquatic center, providing a modern wellness center or community center, and would not substantially increase the size of the existing community and fitness programs. For the same reasons as Alternative A, this Alternative does not provide the framework that the YMCA needs to deliver the wide variety of social, cultural, recreational and educational programs and services relied upon by Chinatown and the surrounding community.

iii. Alternative C: Preservation of Historic Features. Alternative C, Preservation of Historic Features, is rejected in favor of the project and is found infeasible for the following environmental, economic, legal and technological reasons. In order to accommodate most of the programmatic requirements, Alternative C would include a five-story addition with four stories (of substantially smaller floor plate size) set back from Sacramento Street above a ground floor pool. The setback alternative would retain the ground floor for a three-full-lane pool and two partial (1/3) lanes. The alternative would set back at the second floor to the rear third of the existing eastern courtyard, below the central bay of the east façade. The new structure would be approximately 65 feet tall. This Alternative would not meet the sponsor's objectives with respect to aquatic facilities. Although it involves a new pool, it falls short of the project sponsor's objectives to expand the capacity of the pool to meet the YMCA's programmatic requirements and to train neighborhood youths for competitive swimming, as the pool is limited to only three full lanes. The aquatic center is a hallmark of the Chinatown YMCA, and is an important component of the project for the

community and donors. This Alternative would not fully meet the project sponsor's objectives related to providing a modern wellness center with youth community and fitness programs in that the new circulation space would be restricted on four smaller floors, and there would not be an ADA-accessible entry on the ground floor. The Alternative would also not meet the sponsor's objective to have financially feasible expanded health, fitness and community programs, and the setback structure with smaller floor plates and additional levels is substantially less efficient and would involve associated higher construction costs. Importantly, three residential units would be lost with this alternative.

iv. Alternative D: Partial Preservation of Historic Features. Alternative D, Partial Preservation of Historic Features, is rejected in favor of the project and is found infeasible for the following environmental, economic, legal and technological reasons. Alternative D utilizes an atrium along the eastern façade, and would preserve some of the character-defining historic architectural features of the existing building. The entry stairs and porch and the front fence would be removed. The rear addition to the existing building at Sabin Place and interior renovation of residential units would be included in this Alternative. This Alternative would reduce some of the historic resource impacts, but there would still be an unavoidable significant historical impact to the existing building and the proposed district. This Alternative would partially meet the objective related to the aquatic center, as it would be possible to retain the five lanes. However, it would be necessary to include columns for structural support under this Alternative, which compromises sight lines and pool safety. To avoid the column issue, among the other variants in Table 1 of the Response to Comments the project sponsor also considered holding the new addition completely away from the existing building. This approach reduced the size of all program areas including the pool. The project sponsor also considered transferring the vertical loads onto the main girders above the pool. This approach reduced the headroom by a foot (to about 7'6"), added significant cost and seriously impacted the spatial qualities of the Natatorium. This Alternative would not fully meet the objectives related to the wellness center with youth community and fitness programs as the new center circulation space would be restricted on the second and third floors.

3. Other alternatives considered and rejected. Multiple variants of Alternatives C and D were also explored by the project sponsor, all as more particularly set forth in the FEIR. These varied in terms of size, configurations of floor plates, extent of the separation from the existing building and the extent of historical elements preserved. In addition, multiple variants of alternatives were explored that created interior courtyards that exposed the decorated central bay by extending the building across the Sacramento Street frontage. Nine representative variants were submitted to Planning Department staff for the record on December 19, 2007, are addressed in the Responses to Comments to the FEIR and are hereby incorporated by reference in these findings. Variants 2 and 3

depict Alternatives C and D in the FEIR, which have been deemed infeasible for the reasons set forth above. Variants 1, 4 and 5 are variations on the concepts already presented in Alternatives C and D and, similarly, do not meet the basic components of one or all of Objectives 1-3 as set forth in the FEIR. Variants 1 and 4 also would not meet the basic components of Objective 4, and variants 4 and 5 would not fully meet Objective 5. Variants 6-9 do not reduce the impacts on historic resources as compared to the project, and either do not fully meet the basic components of one or all of Objectives 1-5. The Planning Commission concurs with the analysis and conclusions of staff and the project sponsor, set forth as part of the submission, that each of the other remaining variants is infeasible for some or all of the reasons that are set forth above for rejection of the alternatives set forth in the FEIR, and none of these variants presents a feasible alternative that requires further consideration in lieu of or in addition to the reasonable range of alternatives set forth in the FEIR.

B. Mitigation Measures. The mitigation measures listed in the Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program, ("EXHIBIT C") were identified in the FEIR as reducing or eliminating potential environmental impacts of the project. The Planning Commission hereby adopts the Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program, including all of the mitigation measures and improvement measures identified in EXHIBIT C.

C. Significant Environmental Impacts. As described in FEIR Chapter III, Section C: Historical Architectural Resources, construction of the proposed project's east wing addition would compromise historically important design features of the original principal (east) façade and entrance: the ornately decorated front fence would be removed and not reused; the main stairs from the gate leading to the first-floor porch would be demolished; the view of the first and second floors of the rear two-thirds of the east wall would be obscured, including the ornately decorated central bay; the hooded carved wooden doors on opposite sides of the east wall's central bay would be preserved and reused in the interior of the new building; the first and second floor balconies would be removed; and the wooden columns between the two wooden doors and the ornately decorated windows on the first and second floors would be covered and obscured from view. The red-tile-roofed entrance gate would be renovated and reused as the primary entrance to the YMCA. The project sponsor has worked with Planning Department staff on project modifications that provide visual access to the decorated, central bay. The north portion of the building has been reduced by a substantial recess that allows public viewing of the northernmost ornate entry and windows at the first and second floors and from the street. Interior atriums have been added to provide non-public visual access to the balance of the central bay. Nonetheless, considering all of the above, the proposed project would fail to comply with the Secretary of Interior's Standards by demolishing, obscuring, or altering historical features of the east façade and entrance to the existing building and of the associated stairs, gate, and ornamental fence; and by the obscuring of most of the eastern façade from public view.

The YMCA is an important historic resource within the National Register-eligible Chinatown Historic District, and a substantial adverse impact on this building will have an adverse impact on the district as a whole. Implementation of Mitigation Measure 1 would reduce the impact by

documenting the existing building, salvaging character-defining materials from the site and creating an oral history project, but the impact would remain significant and unavoidable.

With the implementation of other mitigation measures outlined set forth in EXHIBIT C, all other potential significant impacts would be reduced to a less-than-significant level. The project sponsor has agreed to implement all mitigation measures listed.

D. Statement of Overriding Considerations. Notwithstanding the significant effects noted above, pursuant to CEQA Section 21080(b), the CEQA Guidelines, and Chapter 31 of the San Francisco Administrative Code, the Planning Commission finds, after considering the FEIR, that overriding economic, legal, social, technological and other considerations, as set forth below, outweigh the identified significant effects on the environment. In addition, the Planning Commission finds that the project Alternatives are also rejected for the following specific economic, social, technological or other considerations, in and of themselves, in addition to the specific considerations discussed in Section 6.A above:

The project enables the City to meet a number of important General Plan objectives and policies as set forth in greater detail in Section 9 below. It helps the City to provide neighborhood centers in areas lacking adequate community facilities because it will result in a new and expanded community center necessary to meet the community's needs, which will augment the existing center which is inadequate to meet those needs. The project will reduce structural hazards to life safety, minimize property damage and resulting social, cultural and economic impacts resulting from future disasters because it will include a new building built to current Building Code requirements, and will make significant upgrades to the existing building, including structural upgrades. The project will maintain a favorable social and cultural climate because it will provide Chinatown and other nearby residents with the opportunity to pursue recreational and cultural interests, including a new outdoor play area, aquatic facility, fitness center, community center, wellness center and other community-serving elements. Finally, the project will further the City's housing goals by providing four new residential hotel units and constructing significant upgrades to existing residential hotel units and associated facilities.

The project also meets the City's objectives because it meets the Priority Policies codified in Planning Code Section 101.1 for the reasons set forth in Section 10 below.

In addition, the project meets the sponsor's objectives as more particularly described in Section 6.A.1 above in that it provides a state-of-the-art community center with the quality and quantity of program space needed to house expanded community programs and to generate the revenue needed in order to ensure the continuing viability of the YMCA in Chinatown. It allows the project sponsor to utilize the property that it controls and to build on its proven attendance and participation at a site that is well served by public transit.

Finally, the project will retain and expand local employment, including employment at the new facility and temporary construction jobs.

Having considered the project benefits discussed in this Section 6, the Planning Commission finds that the benefits of the project outweigh the unavoidable adverse environmental effects, and that the adverse environmental effects are therefore acceptable.

7. **Planning Code Compliance:** The Commission finds that the Project is consistent with the relevant provisions of the Planning Code in the following manner:

- A. **Height Above 35 Feet.** Planning Code Section 812.10 states that a Conditional Use Authorization is required for height above 35 feet, up to 65 feet. Planning Code Section 254 further provides that the purpose of the Conditional Use Authorization is to insure consideration of sun access on adjacent public sidewalk.

The project will not increase the height of the existing building. The new three-story, approximately 40-foot-tall east wing building addition will only exceed the permitted base building height by five feet, and the Sabin Place rear addition, at approximately 32 feet, will be below the permitted base building height. In light of the limited additional building height and the substantial building setback above the ground floor from the street, the east wing addition will not result in substantial new shadow on the adjacent public side walk (Sacramento Street).

- B. **Street Frontage Longer Than 50 Feet.** Planning Code Section 812.14 states that a Conditional Use Authorization is required for street frontage longer than 50 feet. Planning Code Section 145.3 further provides that the Planning Commission shall consider the following criteria for exceptions:

(1) Projects having more than 50 feet of street frontage shall be divided in architectural treatment to appear as two or more independent buildings reflecting the typical scale of older buildings in the Chinatown area. Architectural treatments may include varied types of windows and entries, individual storefronts and the use of differing colors and textures; and

Similar to other existing institutional uses in Chinatown reflecting a large lot size pattern, the YMCA's project site has a street frontage of 137'. The project site is currently occupied by a three-story building on 87' of frontage and an open play yard of 50' of frontage. The new addition will be sited on the play yard.. While the proposed 50' wide addition and existing building will encompass the entire street frontage along Sacramento Street, the addition will be visually articulated as a separate building in the idiom of modern architecture and through its massing. The architecture of the existing building is topped with a tiled, hipped roof; the addition will have a parapet roof, thereby a new shape and different texture will be created. The existing ADA accessible entrance facing Sacramento will remain as an architectural feature and the existing entrance gate will be converted into the main entrance of the addition, which produces varied types of entries. The height is similar to the prevailing building heights in Chinatown, three to four stories. For these reasons the project will appear as two independent buildings.

(2) Flat façade surfaces shall be broken up at least every 30 feet by the projection of bay windows or by vertical recesses.

The 50' wide addition adjacent to the existing 87' wide building will not continue as a flat façade, but will delineated through vertical recessed massing. The ground floor level and vertical circulation

element abuts the sidewalk and is placed closer to the street than the existing building. The balance of the 50' wide new east wing above the ground floor will be recessed from the street and the existing building to provide visual variation along the street frontage.

- C. **Lot Size.** Planning Code Section 812.11 states that a Conditional Use Authorization is required for new construction on a site larger than 5,000 sq. ft. Planning Code Section 121.3 further provides that the Planning Commission shall consider the following criteria for approving construction on such sites:

(1) The mass and façade of the proposed structure are compatible with the existing scale of the district;

Along Sacramento Street, existing buildings range in height from two to six stories. Along Sabin Place and California Street, existing buildings range in height from five to seven stories. The buildings directly adjacent to the site are four to seven stories. The facades of most buildings in Chinatown have no front setback from the front property line and no upper floor setback. However, institutional uses typically provide open space or an activity area. By setting back the second and third floor of the new east wing, not only is a third of the primary facade preserved, a portion of the existing outdoor activity area is recreated. Therefore, the massing and facade of the proposed structure are compatible with the existing scale of the district and is internally consistent with its use.

(2) The façade of the proposed structure is consistent with design features of adjacent facades that contribute to the positive visual quality of the district; and

The modern architecture of the proposed addition will differentiate the existing building from the new building and will clearly denote it as an addition to the existing building. Rustication lines and window patterns are reflective of both the existing building and adjacent buildings.

(3) Façade divisions shall be reinforced by matching changes in height for portions of the building.

As described above, the proposed building is articulated to provide two distinct buildings. The addition will be lower than the existing building.

- D. **Outdoor Activity Area Other Than At Front Of Lot.** Planning Code Section 812.24 provides that conditional use approval is required for Outdoor Activity Areas located other than at the front of the lot.

An outdoor activity area is provided for the use or convenience of patrons of a commercial establishment, per Planning Code Section 890.71. No commercial uses are included in the project proposal, therefore conditional use approval is not required.

- E. **Open Space.** Planning Code Section 135 provides that 48 sq. ft. of usable open space is required for each dwelling unit or group housing unit. The ratio is the same for common usable open space if used in lieu of private usable open space.

The project would add four new residential units that would be subject to this requirement. The project meets this requirement by providing 300 square feet of common usable open space on the 2nd floor of the lobby area at Sabin Place.

- F. **Site Coverage.** Planning Code Section 134.1 provides that lot coverage in the CR/NC District is limited to 75% of the lot area, calculated at the lowest level occupied for dwelling use.

The lowest level occupied by a dwelling use is the third floor, and is an existing condition whereupon the site coverage is 66%, less than the maximum of 75% of the lot area. No building expansion for dwelling use is proposed.

- G. **Parking.** Planning Section 161 (c) provides that no off-street parking shall be required for any use other than dwelling units where a requirement is specified, in the CR/NC District.

The project would add four new residential hotel units, which are classified under the Planning Code as group housing rather than dwelling units and are therefore exempt under Section 161 (c).

8. **Planning Code Section 303** establishes criteria for the Planning Commission to consider when reviewing applications for Conditional Use approval. On balance, the project complies with said criteria in that:

- 1) The proposed new uses and building, at the size and intensity contemplated and at the proposed location, will provide a development that is necessary or desirable, and compatible with, the neighborhood or the community:

(A) In Neighborhood Commercial Districts, if the proposed use is to be located at a location in which the square footage exceeds the limitations found in Planning Code § 121.2(a) or 121.2(b), the following shall be considered:

(i) The intensity of activity in the district is not such that allowing the larger use will be likely to foreclose the location of other needed neighborhood-servicing uses in the area; and

The neighborhood currently consists of a variety of use types, including residential, office, retail, restaurant and bar, church, hotel and parking. Similar buildings and uses are found in the project area on Sacramento Street and along Stockton Street. The proposed uses are recreational, community and residential hotel uses, consistent both with existing uses on the site and the mixed-use character of the neighborhood. The Chinatown YMCA has been a continued institutional use since the 1920s and it is unlikely to foreclose other needed neighborhood-servicing or institutional uses as the YMCA operates under separate programmatic goals and enhances existing uses in the area.

(ii) The proposed use will serve the neighborhood, in whole or in significant part, and the nature of the use requires a larger size in order to function; and

Planning Code Section 812.1 states that "both Stockton and Powell Streets contain a significant amount of housing as well as major community institutions supportive to Chinatown and the

larger Chinese community. . . " and that "housing development in new and existing buildings is encouraged above the ground floor. Institutional uses are also encouraged." The proposed project will result in an enhanced facility to serve an existing population. The Chinatown area is the most densely populated area in the City, and has one of the highest needs for recreational facilities, both indoor and outdoor. The project will provide affordable indoor recreational opportunities for persons working in the financial district and those residing in Chinatown and its surrounding neighborhoods. It will also include an outdoor activity area. The expanded health and fitness center will generate needed income for the Chinatown YMCA social service programs. For the foregoing reasons, the project will provide a development that is necessary and desirable for, and compatible with, the neighborhood and the community.

(iii) The building in which the use is to be located is designed in discrete elements which respect the scale of development in the district; and

There are many buildings of different type, size, and age. Heights on the project block vary from two to seven stories (mostly four to six stories), and up to 21-stories within four blocks of the project site. Grant Avenue, bordering the project block to the east and considered the heart of the Chinatown District, is lined with predominantly three- and four-story mixed-use buildings with ground-floor retail shops and residential and/or commercial uses above. The proposed project is within the existing FAR, density and height requirements, and consistent with the scale of other structures in the vicinity. The new east wing will be visually two stories lower than the existing building and, except for the stair enclosure, the second and third floor will be set back 41'+ from the front property line. The project will include renovations to the third floor to enhance the living conditions with handicapped accessible shower/bathrooms and a new common kitchen and to increase the number of residential hotel units from 21 to 25.

- 2) The proposed project will not be detrimental to the health, safety, convenience or general welfare of persons residing or working in the vicinity. There are no features of the project that could be detrimental to the health, safety or convenience of those residing or working the area, in that:

(A) Nature of proposed site, including its size and shape, and the proposed size, shape and arrangement of structures;

The project is an infill development on an existing site, and would replace a paved area with additional structures. As discussed above, the project is consistent with the scale and character of other uses in the vicinity, and there is nothing unusual about the nature of the site. The buildings in Chinatown commonly have 100% lot coverage except for lightwells. The proposed project (existing building and addition) would have about 91% coverage at the first level, 62% coverage at the second level and 33% coverage at the third level. The new east wing would be lower than the existing building and about the same height as its downhill neighbor. The proposed addition is appropriate for this block and will not adversely affect the neighboring uses. The expanded facility would be compatible with the adjacent institutional, residential, commercial and retail uses, and would not alter the neighborhood character or context. The project would provide recreational activities for persons residing in Chinatown and the eastern slope of Nob Hill.

(B) The accessibility and traffic patterns for persons and vehicles, the type and volume of such traffic, and the adequacy of proposed off-street parking and loading;

Planning Code Section 161(c) provides an exemption from parking requirements for non-dwelling unit uses in the CR/NC District. The four new residential hotel units are considered group housing rather than dwelling units, and so no new spaces are required. The FEIR determined that the proposed project would not result in any potentially significant adverse traffic impacts. All intersections would continue to operate at the same level of service with the project as under existing conditions.

Parking demand for the project would be 22 spaces (11 long term residential demand and 11 short term recreational facilities demand), which would need to be accommodated on-street or in nearby parking facilities. Because the residential hotel units will be rented to low and very-low income households, it is not expected that most residents will own cars. During the daytime and after work, the majority of the users of the health and fitness center will be from the financial district and the surrounding neighborhoods, who will either take transit or walk to the site. During the evening, off-street parking is generally available on the street or in the nearby garages (St. Mary's Garage, Sutter/Stockton Garage, Portsmouth Garage and the Hilton Hotel Garage). The FEIR concludes that given the relatively small unmet parking demand, and the relatively brief period of time when such a deficit would occur, the increased parking demand would not substantially alter the existing character of the area-wide parking situation.

Because the project would have less than 100,000 square feet of residential hotel and recreational uses, it would not be required to, and does not propose to, provide any off-street loading spaces. Loading, unloading and deliveries to the residential hotel units will occur on Sabin Place. Deliveries, loading and unloading for the YMCA programs will take place on the loading zone in front of the site and metered loading spaces on Sacramento Street. The FEIR concludes that the loading space demand can be accommodated within the on-street loading area, and based on the project's low demand for loading spaces, the project would not have a significant loading impact.

(C) The safeguards afforded to prevent noxious or offensive emissions such as noise, glare, dust and odor;

During the construction phase, some noise and dust will be generated. The San Francisco Police Code governs noise levels. The FEIR contains standard mitigation measures that are adequate to address these typical temporary construction noise and air quality conditions.

After completion, the project will include residential hotel, community and recreational uses which would not be expected to produce offensive emissions such as noise, glare, dust or odor. Interior lighting will mainly generate lighting in the evening. Exterior lighting will occur at entrances and at the building at grade, and at play area, and will consist of down lighting in the rear yard area. The windows of the health/fitness center facing the street on the second floor will be double glazed.

(D) Treatment given, as appropriate, to such aspects as landscaping, screening, open spaces, parking and loading areas, service areas, lighting and signs;

Any signage will be governed by Article 6 of the Planning Code and will be reviewed by the Planning Department under a separate permit application. Open space will be provided for the YMCA facility in the form of an approximately 1750 sq. ft. outdoor activity area. The project includes approximately 300 gsf of usable open space on the second floor off of Sabin Place to satisfy the open space requirement for the four new residential hotel units.

- 3) That the use as proposed will comply with the applicable provisions of the Planning Code and will not adversely affect the General Plan.

The Project complies with all relevant requirements and standards of the Planning Code, and is consistent with objectives and policies of the General Plan as detailed below.

- 4) That the use as proposed would provide development that is in conformity with the purpose of the applicable Neighborhood Commercial District.

The proposed project is consistent with the stated purposes of the CR/NC District in that it promotes the mixed-use character of the area, enhances the livability of the neighborhood by providing new recreational facilities and community services and includes residential uses above the ground floor.

9. **General Plan Compliance.** The Project is consistent with the Objectives and Policies of the General Plan in that:

Urban Design Element

- A. City Pattern – Recognize and protect major views in the City, with particular attention to those of open space and water.

The proposed addition will be downhill from and lower than the existing building. Therefore, the addition will not impair any public view corridor, consistent with Objective 1, Policy 1.1.

- B. City Pattern – Recognize and reinforce the existing street pattern, especially as it is related to topography.

The proposed addition is lower than the existing building and will reflect the topography of the site and is compatible with the adjacent buildings, consistent with Objective 1, Policy 1.2.

- C. Conservation - Preserve notable landmarks and areas of historic, architectural or aesthetic value, and promote the preservation of other buildings and features that provide continuity with past development.

The proposed project will maintain the existing Chinatown YMCA building that has served the Community for over 75 years and partially preserve its architectural and aesthetic value, consistent with Objective 2, Policy 2.4.

- D. Conservation – Respect the character of older development nearby in the design of new buildings.

The proposed project will preserve the Sacramento façade of the Chinatown YMCA building and the new addition will be distinguishable by its modern architectural design and materials consistent with Objective 2, Policy 2.6.

- E. Major New Development – Promote harmony in the visual relationships and transitions between new and old buildings.

The new building was designed to avoid false historicism by distinguishing the new building from the existing structure. The original design of the street frontage of the north elevation has been modified to provide greater contextual consistency with the area. The rustication lines at the base of the existing building have been continued to the new addition. The window patterns have been changed to "punched" openings that recall those of the existing building, and greater separation has been provided between the existing portal gate and the new addition, all consistent with Objective 3, Policy 3.1.

- F. Neighborhood Environment – Provide convenient access to a variety of recreation opportunities; Maximize the use of recreation areas for recreational purposes.

The proposed project will provide convenient access to a variety of indoor recreational opportunities for residents in the area, consistent with Objective 4, Policies 4.8 and 4.9.

- G. Neighborhood Environment – Encourage or require the provision of recreation space in private development.

The proposed project will provide usable open space in the form of outdoor playground space and second floor open space for residents, consistent with Objective 4, Policy 4.10.

Commerce and Industry Element

- A. General / Citywide –Promote measures designed to increase the number of San Francisco jobs held by San Francisco Residents and Emphasize job training and retraining programs that will impart skills necessary for participation in the San Francisco labor market.

The proposed project with an expanded health/fitness component will provide employment opportunities to residents. The proposed project will provide approximately 30 new part-time employees and approximately 5 new full-time employees, many of which will be for entry-level employees. Currently, 80% of the staff is San Francisco residents with 10-15% from the service area. Employment opportunities are first advertised with community employment agencies and newspapers. Therefore, the proposed project is consistent with Objective 3, policies 3.2 and 3.3.

- B. Government, Health and Education Services – Promote the provision of adequate health and educational services to all geographical districts and cultural groups in the city.

The proposed project would provide adequate recreational and wellness activities, as well as educational classes for persons of all cultural groups residing in Chinatown and the eastern slope of Nob Hill, which is consistent with Objective 7, policy 7.3.

Community Facilities Element

- A. Neighborhood Center Facilities – Assure that Neighborhood Residents have access to Needed Services and a focus for neighborhood activities.

This element of the City's General Plan cites the YMCA as the type of neighborhood centers that provide recreational, cultural programs, child-watch services, and social services programs, such as

health screening, senior and youth programs, various counseling and referral services. For over 75 years, the Chinatown YMCA has served as a community-based multiservice center. The expansion and renovation of a functionally obsolete facility at the project site will enhance the ability of the YMCA to meet the current and future needs of the community it serves. The proposed project is consistent with the fundamental assumptions for neighborhood facilities, Objective 3, policies 3.1,3.2, 3.3, 3.4, and 3.5.

- B. Neighborhood Center Facilities - Base priority for the development of neighborhood centers on relative need and Program the centers to fill gaps in needed services, and provide adequate facilities for ill housed existing services.

Chinatown is a high need neighborhood for recreational and social services. The proposed project will enable the YMCA to continue to supplement and expand recreational and social services offered by public and other community-based service organizations in the area. The proposed project is consistent with Objective 3, policies 3.6 and 3.7.

- C. Neighborhood Center Facilities – Insure continuing responsiveness to neighborhood needs by making clear assignments of responsibility for supervision of center operation and administration.

The Chinatown YMCA will continue to be managed by a board of directors consisting of a majority of Chinese Americans that will offer expanded recreational and social services activities and services to meet the changing need of the Chinese community and the surrounding neighborhoods, consistent with Objective 4, policy 4.1.

Housing/Residence Element

- A. Housing Supply – Encourage housing development, particularly affordable housing, in neighborhood commercial areas without displacing existing jobs, particularly blue-collar jobs or discouraging new employment opportunities.

The project is consistent with Objective Policy 1.2 in that it provides new affordable units in a neighborhood commercial area without displacing jobs.

- B. Housing Supply – Preserve the stock of existing residential hotels.

The project complies with Objective 2, Policy 2.5 by rehabilitating hotel units and associated facilities and adding four new units.

- C. Housing Supply – Encourage the construction of affordable units for single households in residential hotels and "efficiency" units.

The project complies with Objective 4, Policy 3 by adding four new residential hotel units.

Chinatown Area Plan

- A. Preservation and Conservation – Preserve the distinctive urban character, physical environment and cultural heritage of Chinatown.

The proposed project will maintain the low rise scale of Chinatown's buildings by not exceeding the height of the abutting buildings and harmonizes with the scale of existing buildings in the general area. The addition will maintain Chinatown's sunny, wind-free environment by not casting significant or adverse shadows on the Chinatown Playground, which is located opposite of the project site on Sacramento Street. The existing facility will be renovated and utilized, thus protecting a contributory historic resource of Chinatown. The proposed project is consistent with Objective 1, policies 1.1, 1.2, 1.3, and 1.4.

- B. Housing and Open Space – Stabilize and where possible increase the supply of housing.

The project complies with Objective 3, policies 3.1, 3.2, and 3.3 by rehabilitating the 21 existing residential hotel units and adding four new units, and by assisting long-term residents to find temporary housing in the area while the unreinforced masonry building is seismically upgraded.

- C. Housing and Open Space – Preserve the urban role of Chinatown as a residential neighborhood.

The proposed project will provide usable open space in the form of outdoor playground space and second floor open space for residents, consistent with Objective 4, Policy 4.4.

10. **Planning Code Section 101.1(b)** establishes eight priority-planning policies and requires review of permits for consistency with said policies. On balance, the project does comply with said policies in that:

- 1) That existing neighborhood-serving retail uses be preserved and enhanced and future opportunities for resident employment in and ownership of such businesses be enhanced.

The project includes additional recreational and residential uses that will support neighborhood-serving retail uses. The project will not adversely impact any such uses.

- 2) That existing housing and neighborhood character be conserved and protected in order to preserve the cultural and economic diversity of our neighborhoods.

The project includes four net new residential hotel units, and the upgrading of the existing residential hotel units and support facilities. The project is an in-fill development that is consistent with existing uses on the site and the mixed-use nature and scale of the area.

- 3) That the City's supply of affordable housing be preserved and enhanced.

The project will renovate existing residential hotel units and provide four new units.

- 4) That commuter traffic not impede MUNI transit service or overburden our streets or neighborhood parking.

As discussed above, the project site is well-served by transit. It is not expected that significant numbers of residents will own cars, off-street parking is available elsewhere in the vicinity, and the

overall hotel unit population on the site will be reduced. Accordingly, the project will not adversely impact neighborhood parking or public transit.

- 5) That a diverse economic base be maintained by protecting our industrial and service sectors from displacement due to commercial office development, and that future opportunities for resident employment and ownership in these sectors be enhanced.

The project will not impact any industrial uses.

- 6) That all proposed work will be constructed to current seismic codes, as per the Uniform Building Code, and therefore protect against injury and loss of life in a natural disaster.

The existing building will be renovated and upgraded. The new building will be constructed to all current Building Code requirements.

- 7) That landmarks and historic buildings be preserved.

The project will retain the existing historic structure but will demolish certain of its character-defining features. The CEQA findings include a statement of overriding considerations.

- 8) That our parks and open space and their access to sunlight and vistas be protected from development.

The FEIR includes a shadow study which confirms that the project will not adversely impact the adjacent Chinese Playground.

11. The Project is consistent with and would promote the general and specific purposes of the Code provided under Section 101.1(b) in that, as designed, the Project would contribute to the character and stability of the neighborhood and would constitute a beneficial development.
12. The Commission hereby finds that approval of the Conditional Use authorization would promote the health, safety and welfare of the City.

DECISION

That based upon the Record, the submissions by the Applicant, the staff of the Department and other interested parties, the oral testimony presented to this Commission at the public hearings, and all other written materials submitted by all parties, the Commission hereby **APPROVES Conditional Use Application No. 1999.526 C** subject to the following conditions attached hereto as "EXHIBIT A" which is incorporated herein by reference as though fully set forth.

APPEAL AND EFFECTIVE DATE OF MOTION: Any aggrieved person may appeal this Conditional Use Authorization to the Board of Supervisors within thirty (30) days after the date of this Motion No. 17539. The effective date of this Motion shall be the date of this Motion if not appealed (After the 30-day period has expired) OR the date of the decision of the Board of Supervisors if appealed to the Board of Supervisors. For further information, please contact the Board of Supervisors at (415) 554-5184, City Hall, Room 244, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94012.

I hereby certify that the Planning Commission ADOPTED the foregoing Motion on January 24, 2008.

Linda Avery
Commission Secretary

AYES: Alexander, Antonini, S. Lee, W. Lee, Moore, Olague, Sugaya

NAYS: None

ABSENT: None

ADOPTED: January 24, 2008

Exhibit A

Conditions of Approval

1. This authorization is for a Conditional Use Authorization under Sections 303, 121.3, 145.3 and 254 of the Planning Code to allow height above 35 feet, new construction on a site larger than 5,000 sq. ft. and street frontage longer than 50 feet, all associated with the Chinatown YMCA renovation and building addition project within the CR/NC (Chinatown Residential/Neighborhood Commercial) District and a 65-A Height and Bulk District, in general conformance with plans stamped "EXHIBIT B" and dated January 24, 2008 and included in the docket for **Case No. 1999.526C**, reviewed and approved by the Commission on January 24, 2008.
2. Prior to the issuance of the Building Permit for the Project the Zoning Administrator shall approve and order the recordation of a notice in the Official Records of the Recorder of the City and County of San Francisco for the premises (Assessor's Block 0242, Lot 027), which notice shall state that construction has been authorized by and is subject to the conditions of this Motion. From time to time after the recordation of such notice, at the request of the Project Sponsor, the Zoning Administrator shall affirm in writing the extent to which the conditions of this Motion have been satisfied.
3. Violation of the conditions contained in this Motion or of any other provisions of the Planning Code may be subject to abatement procedures and fines up to \$500 a day in accordance with Planning Code Section 176.
4. Should monitoring of the Conditions of Approval contained in this Exhibit A be required, the Project Sponsor or successors shall pay fees as established in Planning Code Section 351(e)(1).
5. A signage program shall be approved by the Planning Department. Signs and exterior lighting for the facility shall be reviewed and approved by the Planning Department before they are installed, and shall be consistent with the approved signage program.
6. The Project Sponsor shall appoint a Community Liaison Officer to address issues of concern to neighbors related to the operation of this Project. The Project Sponsor shall report the name and telephone number of this Officer to the Zoning Administrator and the neighborhood for reference. The Applicant will keep the above parties apprised should a different liaison be designated.
7. An enclosed garbage area shall be provided within the establishment. All garbage containers shall be kept within the building until pick-up by the disposal company.
8. The project shall be subject to, and the Project Sponsor shall implement and otherwise comply with the Mitigation Measures and Improvement Measure set forth in EXHIBIT C.

9. The Project Sponsor and the Project Architect shall continue to work on design development with the Planning Department, with particular attention given to:
 - a) Detailing of the recess at the north portion of the building that allows public viewing of the northernmost ornate entry and windows at the first and second floors from the street, as well as the interior atriums that have been added to provide non-public visual access to the balance of the central bay; this may include revisions to structural systems if feasible, as determined by the Planning Department;
 - b) Detailing for the removal of historical materials and re-finishing of disturbed surfaces; and
 - c) Final architectural and decorative detailing, materials, glazing, color and texture of exterior finishes.
10. Subject to approval by the Department of Public Works, the Project Sponsor shall install street trees in compliance with Planning Code Section 143.
11. The Project Sponsor shall assure the execution and recordation of the specified conditions as a Notice of Special Restrictions at the Office of the County Recorder / County Clerk.
12. The Planning Commission may, in a public hearing, consider the revocation of this conditional use authorization if a site or building permit has not been issued within three (3) years of the date of the Motion approving the project. Once a site or building permit has been issued, construction must commence within the timeframe required by the Department of Building Inspection and be continued thenceforth diligently to completion. The Commission may also consider revoking this conditional use authorization if a permit for the project has been issued but is allowed to expire and more than three (3) years have passed since the Motion was approved. This authorization may be extended at the discretion of the Zoning Administrator only if the failure to issue a permit by the Department of Building Inspection is delayed by a City, state or federal agency or by appeal of the issuance of such permit.

EXHIBIT C

MITIGATION MEASURES AND MITIGATION MONITORING PROGRAM

File No. Project Title: 1999.536E – Chinatown
YMCA Renovation and Building Addition Project

Motion No.: 17539

Page 1

	MONITORING PROGRAM				
Mitigation Measures Certified in Environmental Impact Report	Responsibility for Implementation	Mitigation Schedule	Mitigation Action	Monitoring/Reporting Responsibility	Monitoring Schedule

MITIGATION MEASURES:

1. HISTORICAL ARCHITECTURE

Prior to construction of the east wing building, the project sponsor shall provide adequate documentation of the existing building. The documentation shall be submitted to the City and County of San Francisco Planning Department and found to be adequate prior to authorization of any permit that may be required for construction of the building. In addition, the project sponsor shall prepare and transmit the photographs and descriptions of the property to the History Room of the San Francisco Public Library and the Northwest Information Center of the California Historic Information Resource System. The documentation shall include:

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A video documentary of the property, including an oral history. - Photo-documentation of the property to Historic American Building Survey Level II documentation standards. The standard size of negatives and transparencies (and accompanying prints) is 5-by-7 inches. Other large-format sizes such as 4-by-5 inches and 8-by-10 inches are also acceptable for formal documentation. Roll film, film packs and electronic manipulation of images are not acceptable. - Images must be fully identified with the name and 	<p>Project sponsor</p>	<p>Prior to demolition and construction activities</p>	<p>Preparation of documentation of the existing building for the Planning Department.</p> <p>Preparation of photographs and descriptions of property for the SF Public Library and the Northwest Information Center of the California Historic Information Resource System.</p>	<p>Planning Department</p>	<p>Considered complete upon Planning Department approval of submitted materials</p>
--	------------------------	--	---	----------------------------	---

EXHIBIT C

MITIGATION MEASURES AND MITIGATION MONITORING PROGRAM

File No. Project Title: 1999.536E – Chinatown
YMCA Renovation and Building Addition Project

Motion No.: 17539

Page 2

MONITORING PROGRAM					
Mitigation Measures Certified in Environmental Impact Report	Responsibility for Implementation	Mitigation Schedule	Mitigation Action	Monitoring/Reporting Responsibility	Monitoring Schedule
<p>location of the structure, a description of the feature or view being photographed and the direction in which the photograph was taken, as well as the name of the photographer and the date created.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Black and white, 35-millimeter photographs of the interior and exterior of the building. Negatives and 5-by-7 inch prints should be processed to meet archival requirements (i.e., negatives must be on safety film only; resin-coated paper is not accepted). - Select scaled drawings, where available, shall be photographically reproduced on Mylar (in accordance with the US Copyright Act) to Historic American Buildings Survey Level II documentation standards. The drawings shall be included as part of the documentation. All drawings, including site plans, shall be appropriately conserved at the site or at a qualified repository. 	<p>Project sponsor</p>	<p>Prior to demolition and construction activities</p>	<p>Salvage character-defining elements of the existing building, as determined by the City in consultation with a qualified historic resources firm.</p>	<p>Planning Department</p>	<p>Considered complete upon issuance of building permits</p>
<p>Prior to construction, the project sponsor shall salvage the character-defining elements of the existing building that are considered to be historically significant, as determined by a qualified architectural historian (and can feasibly be salvaged), and shall consider the retention of the material in the new building, displayed in an interpretive program or shall seek to donate those elements to an organization such as a local historical society. The features to be salvaged shall be determined by the City following consultation with a qualified historic resources firm. Features to be salvaged should include primary character-defining features. The City, prior to the</p>					

EXHIBIT C

MITIGATION MEASURES AND MITIGATION MONITORING PROGRAM

File No. Project Title: 1999.536E – Chinatown
YMCA Renovation and Building Addition Project

Motion No.: 17539
Page 3

MONITORING PROGRAM					
Mitigation Measures Certified in Environmental Impact Report	Responsibility for Implementation	Mitigation Schedule	Mitigation Action	Monitoring/Reporting Responsibility	Monitoring Schedule
issuance of building permits, shall confirm donation of the materials to the historical society or other entity approved by the City.					
2. ARCHEOLOGICAL RESOURCES					
Based on a reasonable presumption that archeological resources may be present within the project site, the following measures shall be undertaken to avoid any potentially significant adverse effect from the proposed project on buried or submerged historical resources.	Project sponsor/ Archeological consultant at the direction of the Environmental Review Officer (ERO)	Prior to soil-disturbing activities	Retain a qualified archeological consultant.	Project sponsor, archeologist and Environmental Review Officer (ERO)	During excavation, demolition and construction. Considered complete upon receipt of final monitoring report at completion of construction.
The project sponsor shall retain the services of a qualified archeological consultant having expertise in California prehistoric and urban historical archeology. The archeological consultant shall undertake an archeological testing program as specified herein. In addition, the consultant shall be available to conduct an archeological monitoring and/or data recovery program if required pursuant to this measure. The archeological consultant's work shall be conducted in accordance with this measure at the direction of the Environmental Review Officer (ERO). All plans and reports prepared by the consultant as specified herein shall be submitted first and directly to the ERO for review and comment, and shall be considered draft reports subject to revision until final approval by the ERO.					

EXHIBIT C

MITIGATION MEASURES AND MITIGATION MONITORING PROGRAM

File No. Project Title: 1999.536E – Chinatown
YMCA Renovation and Building Addition Project

Motion No.: 17539

Page 4

MONITORING PROGRAM					
Mitigation Measures Certified in Environmental Impact Report	Responsibility for Implementation	Mitigation Schedule	Mitigation Action	Monitoring/Reporting Responsibility	Monitoring Schedule
<p>Archeological monitoring and/or data recovery programs required by this measure could suspend construction of the proposed project for up to a maximum of four weeks. At the direction of the ERO, the suspension of construction can be extended beyond four weeks only if such a suspension is the only feasible means to reduce potential effects on a significant archeological resource as defined in CEQA Guidelines Section 15064.5 to a less-than-significant level.</p>					
<p><i>Archeological Testing Program:</i> The archeological consultant shall prepare and submit to the ERO for review and approval an archeological testing plan (ATP). The archeological testing program shall be conducted in accordance with the approved ATP. The ATP shall identify the property types of the expected archeological resource(s) that potentially could be adversely affected by the proposed project, the testing method to be used, and the locations recommended for testing.</p>	<p>Project sponsor/ Archeological consultant at the direction of the Environmental Review Officer (ERO)</p>	<p>Prior to soil- disturbing activities</p>	<p>Prepare and submit draft Archeological Testing Plan</p>	<p>Project sponsor, archeologist and Environmental Review Officer (ERO)</p>	<p>Prior to excavation and construction</p>
<p>The purpose of the archeological testing program will be to determine to the extent possible the presence or absence of archeological resources and to identify and to evaluate whether any archeological resource encountered on the site constitutes an historical resource under CEQA.</p>	<p>Project sponsor/ Archeological consultant at the direction of the Environmental Review Officer (ERO)</p>	<p>Prior to soil- disturbing activities</p>	<p>Implement Archeological Testing Plan</p>	<p>Project sponsor, archeologist and Environmental Review Officer (ERO)</p>	<p>Prior to excavation and construction</p>
<p>At the completion of the archeological testing program, the archeological consultant shall submit a written report of the</p>	<p>Project sponsor/ Archeological</p>	<p>After completion of</p>	<p>Submit report to ERO of the findings of the</p>	<p>Project sponsor, archeologist and</p>	<p>Prior to excavation and construction</p>

EXHIBIT C

MITIGATION MEASURES AND MITIGATION MONITORING PROGRAM

File No. Project Title: 1999.536E – Chinatown
YMCA Renovation and Building Addition Project

Motion No.: 17539

Page 5

MONITORING PROGRAM

Mitigation Measures Certified in Environmental Impact Report	Responsibility for Implementation	Mitigation Schedule	Mitigation Action	Monitoring/Reporting Responsibility	Monitoring Schedule
findings to the ERO.	consultant at the direction of the Environmental Review Officer (ERO)	the Archeological Testing Program	Archeological Testing Program	Environmental Review Officer (ERO)	

If based on the archeological testing program the archeological consultant finds that significant archeological resources may be present, the ERO in consultation with the archeological consultant shall determine if additional measures are warranted. Additional measures that may be undertaken include additional archeological testing, archeological monitoring, and/or an archeological data recovery program.

If the ERO determines that a significant archeological resource is present and that the resource could be adversely affected by the proposed project, the project sponsor can either:

- A. Redesign the proposed project so as to avoid any adverse effect on the significant archeological resource; or;
- B. Implement a data recovery program unless the ERO determines that the archeological resource is of greater interpretive than research significance and that interpretive use of the resource is feasible.

Archeological Monitoring Program (AMP)

If the ERO in consultation with the archeological consultant determines that an archeological monitoring program shall be implemented, the archeological monitoring program shall minimally include the following provisions:

Project sponsor/ Archeological consultant./ Archeological Monitor/Contrac	ERO & Archeological Consultant shall meet prior to	Implement Archeological Monitoring Program	Project sponsor/ Archeological consultant./ Archeological Monitor/Contractor(s),	During all soil- disturbing activities.
---	--	---	--	--

EXHIBIT C

MITIGATION MEASURES AND MITIGATION MONITORING PROGRAM

File No. Project Title: 1999.536E – Chinatown
YMCA Renovation and Building Addition Project

Motion No.: 17539

Page 6

MONITORING PROGRAM

Mitigation Measures Certified in Environmental Impact Report	Responsibility for Implementation	Mitigation Schedule	Mitigation Action	Monitoring/Reporting Responsibility	Monitoring Schedule
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The archeological consultant, project sponsor, and ERO shall meet and consult on the scope of the AMP reasonably prior to any project-related soils disturbing activities commencing. The ERO in consultation with the archeological consultant shall determine what project activities shall be archeologically monitored. In most cases, any soils-disturbing activities, such as demolition, foundation removal, excavation, grading, utilities installation, foundation work, driving of piles (foundation, shoring, etc.), site remediation, etc., shall require archeological monitoring because of the risk these activities pose to potential archeological resources and to their depositional context; 	tor(s), at the direction of the ERO	commencement of soil-disturbing activity. If the ERO determines that an Archeological Monitoring Program is necessary, monitor throughout all soil-disturbing activities.		and the ERO	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The archeological consultant shall advise all project contractors to be on the alert for evidence of the presence of the expected resource(s), to identify the evidence of the expected resource(s), and of the appropriate protocol in the event of apparent discovery of an archeological resource; 	Archeological Consultant	Determination that an AMP shall be implemented	Advise all project contractors to be on the alert for evidence of the presence of the expected resource(s), of how to identify the evidence of the expected resource(s), and of the appropriate protocol in the event of apparent discovery of an archeological resource	Project sponsor, archeologist and Environmental Review Officer (ERO)	During all soil disturbing activities
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The archeological monitor(s) shall be present on the project site according to a schedule agreed upon by the archeological consultant and the ERO until the ERO has, in 	Archeological Consultant	Determination that an AMP shall be implemented	Archeological monitor shall be present on the project site according to a schedule agreed upon by the	Project sponsor, archeologist and Environmental Review Officer (ERO)	During all soil disturbing activities

EXHIBIT C

MITIGATION MEASURES AND MITIGATION MONITORING PROGRAM

File No. Project Title: 1999.536E – Chinatown
YMCA Renovation and Building Addition Project

Motion No.: 17539

Page 7

MONITORING PROGRAM					
Mitigation Measures Certified in Environmental Impact Report	Responsibility for Implementation	Mitigation Schedule	Mitigation Action	Monitoring/Reporting Responsibility	Monitoring Schedule
consultation with project archeological consultant, determined that project construction activities could have no effects on significant archeological deposits;			archeological consultant and the ERO		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The archeological monitor(s) shall record and be authorized to collect soil samples and artifactual/ ecofactual material as warranted for analysis; 	Archeological Consultant	Determination that an AMP shall be implemented	Record and collect soil samples and artifactual/ ecofactual material	Project sponsor, archeologist and Environmental Review Officer (ERO)	During all soil disturbing activities
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> If an intact archeological deposit is encountered, all soils-disturbing activities in the vicinity of the deposit shall cease. The archeological monitor shall be empowered to temporarily redirect demolition/ excavation/ pile driving/ construction activities and equipment until the deposit is evaluated. If in the case of pile driving activity (foundation, shoring, etc.), the archeological monitor has cause to believe that the pile driving activity may affect an archeological resource, the pile driving activity shall be terminated until an appropriate evaluation of the resource has been made in consultation with the ERO. The archeological consultant shall immediately notify the ERO of the encountered archeological deposit. The archeological consultant shall make a reasonable effort to assess the identity, integrity, and significance of the encountered archeological deposit, and present the findings of this assessment to the ERO. 	Archeological consultant	Discovery of archeological deposit	<p style="text-align: center;">Cease all soils-disturbing activities in the vicinity of the deposit</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Redirect activities and equipment</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Notify ERO of encountered archeological deposit</p>	Project sponsor, archeologist and Environmental Review Officer (ERO)	During all soil disturbing activities
Whether or not significant archeological resources are encountered, the archeological consultant shall submit a written report of the findings of the monitoring program to the ERO.	Project sponsor/ Archeological consultant	If ERO determines that an Archeological	Submit a report of findings of the Archeological Monitoring Program	Project sponsor, archeologist and Environmental Review Officer (ERO)	During all soil disturbing activities

EXHIBIT C

MITIGATION MEASURES AND MITIGATION MONITORING PROGRAM

File No. Project Title: 1999.536E – Chinatown
YMCA Renovation and Building Addition Project

Motion No.: 17539

Page 8

MONITORING PROGRAM					
Mitigation Measures Certified in Environmental Impact Report	Responsibility for Implementation	Mitigation Schedule	Mitigation Action	Monitoring/Reporting Responsibility	Monitoring Schedule
		Monitoring Program is necessary, submit after completion of the Archeological Monitoring Program			
<p><i>Archeological Data Recovery Program (ADRP):</i></p> <p>The archeological data recovery program shall be conducted in accord with an archeological data recovery plan. The archeological consultant, project sponsor, and ERO shall meet and consult on the scope of the ADRP prior to preparation of a draft ADRP. The archeological consultant shall submit a draft ADRP to the ERO. The ADRP shall identify how the proposed data recovery program will preserve the significant information the archeological resource is expected to contain. The ADRP will identify what scientific/historical research questions are applicable to the expected resource, what data classes the resource is expected to possess, and how the expected data classes would address the applicable research questions. Data recovery, in general, should be limited to the portions of the historical property that could be adversely affected by the proposed project. Destructive data recovery methods shall not be applied to portions of the archeological resources if nondestructive methods are practical.</p>	<p>Archeological consultant at the direction of the ERO</p> <p>Archeological Consultant, Project Sponsor and ERO</p>	<p>If there is a determination by the ERO that an ADR program is required</p>	<p>Prepare an Archeological Data Recovery Plan (ADRP)</p> <p>Meet and consult on scope of ADRP</p>	<p>Project sponsor, archeologist and Environmental Review Officer (ERO)</p> <p>Project sponsor, archeologist and Environmental Review Officer (ERO)</p>	<p>During all soil disturbing activities</p>

The scope of the ADRP shall include the following elements:

EXHIBIT C

MITIGATION MEASURES AND MITIGATION MONITORING PROGRAM

File No. Project Title: 1999.536E – Chinatown
YMCA Renovation and Building Addition Project

Motion No.: 17539

Page 9

MONITORING PROGRAM					
Mitigation Measures Certified in Environmental Impact Report	Responsibility for Implementation	Mitigation Schedule	Mitigation Action	Monitoring/Reporting Responsibility	Monitoring Schedule
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Field Methods and Procedures.</i> Descriptions of proposed field strategies, procedures, and operations. • <i>Cataloguing and Laboratory Analysis.</i> Description of selected cataloguing system and artifact analysis procedures. • <i>Discard and Deaccession Policy.</i> Description of and rationale for field and post-field discard and deaccession policies. • <i>Interpretive Program.</i> Consideration of an on-site/off-site public interpretive program during the course of the archeological data recovery program. • <i>Security Measures.</i> Recommended security measures to protect the archeological resource from vandalism, looting, and non-intentionally damaging activities. • <i>Final Report.</i> Description of proposed report format and distribution of results. • <i>Curation.</i> Description of the procedures and recommendations for the curation of any recovered data having potential research value, identification of appropriate curation facilities, and a summary of the accession policies of the curation facilities. 					
<p><i>Human Remains and Associated or Unassociated Funerary Objects:</i> The treatment of human remains and of associated or unassociated funerary objects discovered during any soils</p>	Project Sponsor/Archeological	In the event human remains and/or funerary	Contact the San Francisco County Coroner. Implement regulatory requirements, if	Project sponsor, archeologist and Environmental Review	During all soil disturbing activities

EXHIBIT C

MITIGATION MEASURES AND MITIGATION MONITORING PROGRAM

File No. Project Title: 1999.536E – Chinatown
YMCA Renovation and Building Addition Project

Motion No.: 17539

Page 10

MONITORING PROGRAM

Mitigation Measures Certified in Environmental Impact Report	Responsibility for Implementation	Mitigation Schedule	Mitigation Action	Monitoring/Reporting Responsibility	Monitoring Schedule
<p>disturbing activity shall comply with applicable State and Federal laws. This shall include immediate notification of the Coroner of the City and County of San Francisco and in the event of the Coroner's determination that the human remains are Native American remains, notification of the California State Native American Heritage Commission (NAHC) who shall appoint a Most Likely Descendant (MLD) (Pub. Res. Code Sec. 5097.98). The archeological consultant, project sponsor, and MLD shall make all reasonable efforts to develop an agreement for the treatment of, with appropriate dignity, human remains and associated or unassociated funerary objects with appropriate dignity (CEQA Guidelines. Sec. 15064.5(d)). The agreement should take into consideration the appropriate excavation, removal, recordation, analysis, custodianship, curation, and final disposition of the human remains and associated or unassociated funerary objects.</p>	<p>Consultant in consultation with the San Francisco Coroner, NAHC and MDL</p>	<p>objects are encountered</p>	<p>applicable, regarding discovery of Native American human remains and associated/unassociated funerary objects.</p> <p>Development of agreement for treatment of human remains or funerary objects</p>	<p>Officer (ERO)</p>	
<p><i>Final Archeological Resources Report:</i> The archeological consultant shall submit a Draft Final Archeological Resources Report (FARR) to the ERO that evaluates the historical significance of any discovered archeological resource and describes the archeological and historical research methods employed in the archeological testing/monitoring/data recovery program(s) undertaken. Information that may put at risk any archeological resource shall be provided in a separate removable insert within the final report.</p>	<p>Project Sponsor/ Archeological Consultant at the direction of the ERO</p>	<p>After completion of the archeological data recovery, inventorying, analysis and interpretation</p>	<p>Submit a Draft Final Archeological Resources Report (FARR)</p>	<p>Project sponsor, archeologist and Environmental Review Officer (ERO)</p>	<p>Following completion of soil disturbing activities</p>
<p>Once approved by the ERO, copies of the FARR shall be distributed as follows: California Archeological Site Survey</p>	<p>Archeological Consultant at the</p>	<p>Written certification</p>	<p>Distribution of Final FARR</p>	<p>Project sponsor, archeologist and</p>	<p>Considered complete upon Planning</p>

EXHIBIT C

MITIGATION MEASURES AND MITIGATION MONITORING PROGRAM

File No. Project Title: 1999.536E – Chinatown
YMCA Renovation and Building Addition Project

Motion No.: 17539

Page 11

MONITORING PROGRAM

Mitigation Measures Certified in Environmental Impact Report	Responsibility for Implementation	Mitigation Schedule	Mitigation Action	Monitoring/Reporting Responsibility	Monitoring Schedule
Northwest Information Center (NWIC) shall receive one (1) copy and the ERO shall receive a copy of the transmittal of the FARR to the NWIC. The Major Environmental Analysis division of the Planning Department shall receive three copies of the FARR along with copies of any formal site recordation forms (CA DPR 523 series) and/or documentation for nomination to the National Register of Historical Places/California Register of Historical Resources. In instances of high public interest in or the high interpretive value of the resource, the ERO may require a different final report content, format, and distribution than that presented above.	direction of the ERO	submitted to ERO that required FARR distribution has been completed.		Environmental Review Officer (ERO)	Department receipt of report
3. CONSTRUCTION AIR QUALITY Consistent with the BAAQMD's dust control measures, the project sponsor shall require the construction contractor(s) to spray unpaved construction areas of the project site with non-potable water during excavation, grading, and site preparation activities at least twice per day; to cover stockpiles of soil, sand and other such material on-site and during hauling; and sweep surrounding streets during these periods at least once per day to reduce particulate emissions. Ordinance No. 175-91, passed by the Board of Supervisors on May 6, 1991, requires that non-potable water be used for dust control activities. The project sponsor shall require the construction contractor(s) to obtain reclaimed water from the Clean Water Program for this purpose.	Project sponsor	During demolition, excavation and construction	Spray site where necessary, cover materials, and sweep area, and use reclaimed water where necessary	Contractor shall prepare daily field reports on non-potable water spraying and compliance of other activities for construction manager. Provide the Departments of Public Works, Building Inspection and Planning with monthly reports during construction period.	During demolition, excavation and construction. Considered complete upon receipt of final monitoring report at completion of construction.

EXHIBIT C

MITIGATION MEASURES AND MITIGATION MONITORING PROGRAM

File No. Project Title: 1999.536E – Chinatown
YMCA Renovation and Building Addition Project

Motion No.: 17539

Page 12

MONITORING PROGRAM					
Mitigation Measures Certified in Environmental Impact Report	Responsibility for Implementation	Mitigation Schedule	Mitigation Action	Monitoring/Reporting Responsibility	Monitoring Schedule
<p>The project sponsor shall require the project contractor(s) to maintain and operate construction equipment so as to minimize exhaust emissions of particulates and other pollutants, by such means as prohibiting idling motors when equipment is not in use or when trucks are waiting in queues, and implementing specific maintenance programs to reduce emissions for equipment that would be in frequent use for much of the construction period.</p>	Project sponsor	During demolition, excavation and construction	Minimize exhaust emissions	Contractor and Project sponsor's construction manager	Throughout the construction period. Considered complete upon receipt of final monitoring report at completion of construction.
<p>4. OTHER HAZARDOUS BUILDING MATERIALS (PCBS, MERCURY, LEAD AND OTHERS)</p>					
<p>The project sponsor would ensure that building surveys for PCB- and mercury-containing equipment (including elevator equipment), hydraulic oils, fluorescent lights, lead, mercury, and other potentially toxic building materials are performed prior to the start of renovation. Any hazardous materials so discovered would be abated according to federal, state, and local laws and regulations.</p>	Project sponsor	Prior to issuance of building permit	Completion of building surveys for hazardous materials	Department of Public Health	Considered complete upon issuance of building permit
<p>IMPROVEMENT MEASURE:</p>					
<p>1. CONSTRUCTION-RELATED TRANSPORTATION IMPACTS</p>					
<p>To reduce the construction-related transportation impacts, the project sponsor would implement the following measures:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Limiting truck movements to the hours between 9:00 a.m. and 3:30 p.m. (or other times, if approved by the Department of Parking and Traffic (DPT)), thereby 	Project sponsor	Before and during construction	Limiting truck movements;	Planning Department and DPT	Considered complete after construction

EXHIBIT C

MITIGATION MEASURES AND MITIGATION MONITORING PROGRAM

File No. Project Title: 1999.536E – Chinatown
YMCA Renovation and Building Addition Project

Motion No.: 17539
Page 13

MONITORING PROGRAM					
Mitigation Measures Certified in Environmental Impact Report	Responsibility for Implementation	Mitigation Schedule	Mitigation Action	Monitoring/Reporting Responsibility	Monitoring Schedule
<p>minimizing disruption of the general traffic flow on adjacent streets during the a.m. and p.m. peak periods.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> To improve operating conditions, the project sponsor and construction contractor(s) would meet with the traffic Engineering Division of DPT, the Fire Department, Muni, and the Planning Department to determine feasible measures to reduce traffic congestion, including traffic disruption and pedestrian circulation conditions. To accommodate the temporary parking demand of construction workers, the project sponsor would need to make arrangements at parking facilities in the area or shuttle workers to the project area from outside the area. 			<p>meeting with the traffic engineering division of the Department of Parking and Traffic (DPT), Muni, and the Planning Department to determine feasible measures; and</p> <p>making arrangements for construction parking or shuttling workers.</p>		