



# SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING DEPARTMENT

---

## Historic Preservation Commission Motion No. 0044

HEARING DATE: JANUARY 6, 2010

*Hearing Date:* January 6, 2010  
*Filing Date:* November 9, 2009  
*Case No.:* **2009.1054A**  
*Project Address:* **1000 Great Highway (Golden Gate Park Music Concourse)**  
*Historic Landmark:* No. 249: Golden Gate Park Music Concourse  
*Zoning:* P (Public)  
OS (Open Space) Height and Bulk District  
*Block/Lot:* 1700/001  
*Applicant:* Rick Thall, Recreation and Parks Department  
30 Van Ness Avenue, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94102  
*Staff Contact* Shelley Caltagirone - (415) 558-6625  
[shelley.caltagiron@sfgov.org](mailto:shelley.caltagiron@sfgov.org)  
*Reviewed By* Tina Tam - (415) 558-6325  
[tina.tam@sfgov.org](mailto:tina.tam@sfgov.org)

1650 Mission St.  
Suite 400  
San Francisco,  
CA 94103-2479

Reception:  
**415.558.6378**

Fax:  
**415.558.6409**

Planning  
Information:  
**415.558.6377**

**ADOPTING FINDINGS FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR PROPOSED WORK DETERMINED TO BE APPROPRIATE FOR AND CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSES OF ARTICLE 10, TO MEET THE STANDARDS OF ARTICLE 10 AND TO MEET THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR'S STANDARDS FOR REHABILITATION, FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED ON LOT 001 IN ASSESSOR'S BLOCK 1700, WITHIN AN P (PUBLIC) ZONING DISTRICT AND A OS (OPEN SPACE HEIGHT AND BULK DISTRICT.**

### PREAMBLE

WHEREAS, on November 9, 2009, Rick Thall (Project Sponsor) filed an application with the San Francisco Planning Department (hereinafter "Department") for a Certificate of Appropriateness for restoration of the Concourse's four fountains - the two Page Fountains (1914), the Rideout Fountain (1924), and Pheobe Hearst Fountain (1927) - that are all contributing features of the site; installation of a new controller box; installation of a new drinking fountain; and, installation of new concrete block paving around the perimeter of the fountains to deter skateboarding use. At each fountain, the work will include cataloging and assessing existing conditions; replacing the 1970s pump pits and submersible pumps; replacing the spray rings with new rings to replicate the historic spray pattern; routing new plumbing and wiring through the re-poured concrete basin floors so that the fountain mechanics can be relocated below ground to prevent tripping hazards and vandalism; coating the interior of the new concrete basins with a waterproof coating to prevent leaking; repairing deteriorated features wherever possible; and, replacing elements that are missing or damaged beyond repair with new elements to match in terms of design, detail, material composition, finish, and color. Specifically, at the Rideout

Fountain the statuary will be removed from the site for restoration with the intent to fully restore the original statuary, which has been damaged by chlorinated water and vandalism. Also, at the Pheobe Hearst Fountain, severely deteriorated balusters will be replaced to match the existing.

As listed above, the project involves the installation of three new features on the Concourse grounds. The new fountain mechanics will require a new controller box to be located on the Concourse grounds within view of the four fountains. These controls will be housed in a painted steel box (approximately 2'x2'x3' tall). The control box will be located behind a bench adjacent to the paved path where it will not affect the historic grid of trees. Also, a new drinking fountain of the same make and model as those added at two locations along the upper pedestrian promenade during the Surface Improvement Project will be added to the lower bowl. The new drinking fountain will be located in the vicinity of a historic drinking fountain that was previously removed. Lastly, new concrete block paving with mortared joints will replace the existing flat concrete around the Rideout and Page Fountains to deter skateboarding and protect the granite fountain curbs. The work will take place within the Golden Gate Park Music Concourse located on lot 001 in Assessor's Block 1700.

WHEREAS, the Project was determined by the Department to be categorically exempt from environmental review. The Historic Preservation Commission (hereinafter "Commission") has reviewed and concurs with said determination.

WHEREAS, on January 6, 2010, the Commission conducted a duly noticed public hearing on the current project, Case No. 2009.1054A ("Project") for its appropriateness.

WHEREAS, in reviewing the Application, the Commission has had available for its review and consideration case reports, plans, and other materials pertaining to the Project contained in the Department's case files, has reviewed and heard testimony and received materials from interested parties during the public hearing on the Project.

**MOVED**, that the Commission hereby grants the Certificate of Appropriateness, in conformance with the architectural plans dated October 30, 2009 and labeled Exhibit B on file in the docket for Case No. 2009.1054A based on the following findings:

## **FINDINGS**

Having reviewed all the materials identified in the recitals above and having heard oral testimony and arguments, this Commission finds, concludes, and determines as follows:

1. The above recitals are accurate and also constitute findings of the Commission.
2. Findings pursuant to Article 10:

The Historical Preservation Commission has determined that the proposed work is compatible with the character of the landmark as described in the designation report dated February 10, 2005.

- The project will restore the historic function of the fountains at the site, thereby preserving and enhancing the historic use of the space as public open space.
- The distinctive character of the fountains and property will be preserved. All historic elements including copings, statuaries, stairs, balustrades, and water display will be restored or replaced with new elements that match in terms of design, detail, material composition, finish, and color. The proposed paving around the perimeter of the Rideout and Page Fountains will be a subtle change that does not affect the character of the space and that protects the historic fountains without adding visually obtrusive clips or other deterrents directly to the copings.
- No conjectural features or elements from other historic properties will be added to the Music Concourse. The new site features, including the drinking fountain, paving, and new electrical and mechanical fountain elements, will be designed in a contemporary and compatible fashion.
- All of the distinctive materials, features, finishes and construction techniques and examples of fine craftsmanship that characterize the property will be preserved. While the defunct fountain mechanics will be replaced with modern mechanics, there is no evidence that these functional components of the fountains contain special historical or aesthetic significance.
- Where historic elements are missing or damaged beyond repair, the replacement elements will match it terms of design, detail, material composition, color, and finish.
- The proposed waterproofing treatment of the fountain basins will not harm the historic fountain materials as it will only be applied to the newly poured concrete basin and that no other treatments will be used that do not meet preservation standards.
- The addition of the new controller box, drinking fountain, and paving material to the site will not destroy historic materials, features, or spatial relationships that characterize the property. Each new feature will be relatively small and non-descript in design and will be located in unobtrusive areas of the Concourse.
- The proposed new features may be removed in the future without causing damage to the Music Concourse.
- The proposed project meets the following Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:

***Standard 1.***

*A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.*

***Standard 2.***

*The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials*

*or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*

**Standard 3.**

*Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.*

**Standard 5.**

*Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*

**Standard 6.**

*Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.*

**Standard 7.**

*Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.*

**Standard 9.**

*New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*

**Standard 10.**

*New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

3. **General Plan Compliance.** The proposed Certificate of Appropriateness is, on balance, consistent with the following Objectives and Policies of the General Plan:

I. URBAN DESIGN ELEMENT

THE URBAN DESIGN ELEMENT CONCERNS THE PHYSICAL CHARACTER AND ORDER OF THE CITY, AND THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN PEOPLE AND THEIR ENVIRONMENT.

GOALS

*The Urban Design Element is concerned both with development and with preservation. It is a concerted effort to recognize the positive attributes of the city, to enhance and conserve those attributes, and to improve the living environment where it is less than satisfactory. The Plan is a definition of quality, a definition based upon human needs.*

OBJECTIVE 1

EMPHASIS OF THE CHARACTERISTIC PATTERN WHICH GIVES TO THE CITY AND ITS NEIGHBORHOODS AN IMAGE, A SENSE OF PURPOSE, AND A MEANS OF ORIENTATION.

POLICY 1.3

*Recognize that buildings, when seen together, produce a total effect that characterizes the city and its districts.*

OBJECTIVE 2

CONSERVATION OF RESOURCES WHICH PROVIDE A SENSE OF NATURE, CONTINUITY WITH THE PAST, AND FREEDOM FROM OVERCROWDING.

POLICY 2.4

*Preserve notable landmarks and areas of historic, architectural or aesthetic value, and promote the preservation of other buildings and features that provide continuity with past development.*

POLICY 2.5

*Use care in remodeling of older buildings, in order to enhance rather than weaken the original character of such buildings.*

POLICY 2.7

*Recognize and protect outstanding and unique areas that contribute in an extraordinary degree to San Francisco's visual form and character.*

*The goal of a Certificate of Appropriateness is to provide additional oversight for buildings and districts that are architecturally or culturally significant to the City in order to protect the qualities that are associated with that significance.*

*The proposed project qualifies for a Certificate of Appropriateness and therefore furthers these policies and objectives by maintaining and preserving the character-defining features of the Alamo Square Historic District for the future enjoyment and education of San Francisco residents and visitors.*

4. The proposed project is generally consistent with the eight General Plan priority policies set forth in Section 101.1 in that:

- A) The existing neighborhood-serving retail uses will be preserved and enhanced and future opportunities for resident employment in and ownership of such businesses will be enhanced:

*The proposed project is for the restoration of urban park features and will not have any impact on neighborhood serving retail uses.*

- B) The existing housing and neighborhood character will be conserved and protected in order to preserve the cultural and economic diversity of our neighborhoods:

*The proposed project will strengthen neighborhood character by respecting the character-defining features of the Music Concourse in conformance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.*

- C) The City's supply of affordable housing will be preserved and enhanced:

*The project will have no impact to housing supply.*

- D) The commuter traffic will not impede MUNI transit service or overburden our streets or neighborhood parking:

*The proposed project will not result in commuter traffic impeding MUNI transit service or overburdening the streets or neighborhood parking.*

- E) A diverse economic base will be maintained by protecting our industrial and service sectors from displacement due to commercial office development. And future opportunities for resident employment and ownership in these sectors will be enhanced:

*The proposed will not have any impact on industrial and service sector jobs.*

- F) The City will achieve the greatest possible preparedness to protect against injury and loss of life in an earthquake.

*Preparedness against injury and loss of life in an earthquake is unaffected by the proposed work. Any construction or alteration associated will be executed in compliance with all applicable construction and safety measures.*

- G) That landmark and historic buildings will be preserved:

*The proposed project is in conformance with Article 10 of the Planning Code and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.*

- H) Parks and open space and their access to sunlight and vistas will be protected from development:

*The proposed project will restore existing historic features of Golden Gate Park and will not impact the access to sunlight or vistas for the parks and open space.*

5. For these reasons, the proposal overall, is appropriate for and consistent with the purposes of Article 10, meets the standards of Article 10, and the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, General Plan and Prop M findings of the Planning Code.

**DECISION**

That based upon the Record, the submissions by the Applicant, the staff of the Department and other interested parties, the oral testimony presented to this Commission at the public hearings, and all other written materials submitted by all parties, the Commission hereby **GRANTS Certificate of Appropriateness No. 2009.1054A** attached hereto as "EXHIBIT A" which is incorporated herein by reference as though fully set forth.

**APPEAL AND EFFECTIVE DATE OF MOTION: APPEAL: Any aggrieved person may appeal this Motion to the Board of Appeals within fifteen (15) days after the date of this Motion No. 0044. The effective date of this Motion shall be the date of this Motion. For further information, please contact the Board of Appeals in person at 1650 Mission Street, (Room 304) or call 575-6880.**

I hereby certify that the Historical Preservation Commission ADOPTED the foregoing Motion on January 6, 2010.

Linda D. Avery  
Commission Secretary

AYES: Buckley, Hasz, Martinez, Matsuda, Wolfram

NAYS: 0

ABSENT: Chase, Damkroger

ADOPTED: January 6, 2010

EXHIBIT A

# Certificate of Appropriateness

**Case No:** 2009.1054A

**Assessor's Block: Lot:** 1700/001

**Address of Property:** 1000 Great Highway (Golden Gate Park Music Concourse)

**Date Application Filed:** November 9, 2009

**Historic Landmark:** No. 249: Golden Gate Park Music Concourse

**Description of Work Proposed:**

The proposed work includes restoration of the Concourse's four fountains - the two Page Fountains (1914), the Rideout Fountain (1924), and Pheobe Hearst Fountain (1927) - that are all contributing features of the site; installation of a new controller box; installation of a new drinking fountain; and, installation of new concrete block paving around the perimeter of the fountains to deter skateboarding use. At each fountain, the work will include cataloging and assessing existing conditions; replacing the 1970s pump pits and submersible pumps; replacing the spray rings with new rings to replicate the historic spray pattern; routing new plumbing and wiring through the re-poured concrete basin floors so that the fountain mechanics can be relocated below ground to prevent tripping hazards and vandalism; coating the interior of the new concrete basins with a waterproof coating to prevent leaking; repairing deteriorated features wherever possible; and, replacing elements that are missing or damaged beyond repair with new elements to match in terms of design, detail, material composition, finish, and color. Specifically, at the Rideout Fountain the statuary will be removed from the site for restoration with the intent to fully restore the original statuary, which has been damaged by chlorinated water and vandalism. Also, at the Pheobe Hearst Fountain, severely deteriorated balusters will be replaced to match the existing.

As listed above, the project involves the installation of three new features on the Concourse grounds. The new fountain mechanics will require a new controller box to be located on the Concourse grounds within view of the four fountains. These controls will be housed in a painted steel box (approximately 2'x2'x3' tall). The control box will be located behind a bench adjacent to the paved path where it will not affect the historic grid of trees. Also, a new drinking fountain of the same make and model as those added at two locations along the upper pedestrian promenade during the Surface Improvement Project will be added to the lower bowl. The new drinking fountain will be located in the vicinity of a historic drinking fountain that was previously removed. Lastly, new concrete block paving with mortared joints will replace the existing flat concrete around the Rideout and Page Fountains to deter skateboarding and protect the granite fountain curbs.



**Final Action by the Historic Preservation Commission on January 6, 2010:**

The Commission has reviewed the proposed work and has determined that the work would not have a significant impact upon and would not be potentially detrimental to the landmark site. A motion to APPROVE the work was passed 5-0 by the Historic Preservation Commission in conformance with the drawings stamped Exhibit B, on file in the docket for **Case No. 2009.1054A**, based upon the following findings:

**Findings of the Historic Preservation Commission:**

- The project will restore the historic function of the fountains at the site, thereby preserving and enhancing the historic use of the space as public open space.
- The distinctive character of the fountains and property will be preserved. All historic elements including copings, statuary, stairs, balustrades, and water display will be restored or replaced with new elements that match in terms of design, detail, material composition, finish, and color. The proposed paving around the perimeter of the Rideout and Page Fountains will be a subtle change that does not affect the character of the space and that protects the historic fountains without adding visually obtrusive clips or other deterrents directly to the copings.
- No conjectural features or elements from other historic properties will be added to the Music Concourse. The new site features, including the drinking fountain, paving, and new electrical and mechanical fountain elements, will be designed in a contemporary and compatible fashion.
- All of the distinctive materials, features, finishes and construction techniques and examples of fine craftsmanship that characterize the property will be preserved. While the defunct fountain mechanics will be replaced with modern mechanics, there is no evidence that these functional components of the fountains contain special historical or aesthetic significance.
- Where historic elements are missing or damaged beyond repair, the replacement elements will match it terms of design, detail, material composition, color, and finish.
- The proposed waterproofing treatment of the fountain basins will not harm the historic fountain materials as it will only be applied to the newly poured concrete basin and that no other treatments will be used that do not meet preservation standards.
- The addition of the new controller box, drinking fountain, and paving material to the site will not destroy historic materials, features, or spatial relationships that characterize the property. Each new feature will be relatively small and non-descript in design and will be located in unobtrusive areas of the Concourse.
- The proposed new features may be removed in the future without causing damage to the Music Concourse.
- The proposed project meets the following Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:

***Standard 1.***

*A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.*

***Standard 2.***

*The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*

***Standard 3.***

*Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.*

***Standard 5.***

*Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.*

***Standard 6.***

*Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.*

***Standard 7.***

*Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.*

***Standard 9.***

*New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*

***Standard 10.***

*New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

For these reasons, the proposal overall, is appropriate for and consistent with the purposes of Article 10, meets the standards of Article 10, and the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, the General Plan and Prop M Findings of the Planning Code.

**Duration of this Certificate of Appropriateness:** This Certificate of Appropriateness is issued pursuant to Article 10 of the Planning Code and is valid for a period of three (3) years from the effective date of approval by the Historic Preservation Commission. Implementation of this Certificate of

Appropriateness is accomplished by completion of construction work (verified through a job card signed by a District Building Inspector) after issuance of an appropriate Building Permit.

**APPEAL:** Any aggrieved person may appeal the action on this Certificate of Appropriateness by appeal of the issuance of the Building Permit required to implement the proposed work. Contact the Board of Appeals (575-6880) for instructions on filing a permit appeal.

**THIS IS NOT A PERMIT TO COMMENCE ANY WORK OR CHANGE OF OCCUPANCY UNLESS NO BUILDING PERMIT IS REQUIRED. PERMITS FROM THE DEPARTMENT OF BUILDING INSPECTION (and any other appropriate agencies) MUST BE SECURED BEFORE WORK IS STARTED OR OCCUPANCY IS CHANGED.**