



SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING DEPARTMENT

Historic Preservation Commission Motion No. 0048

HEARING DATE: FEBRUARY 17, 2010

Hearing Date: February 17, 2010
Filing Date: December 8, 2009
Case No.: **2009.1122A**
Project Address: **900 North Point Street (a.k.a. 851 Beach Street)**
Historic Landmark: No. 30: Ghirardelli Square
Zoning: C-2 (Commercial)
Northern Waterfront Special Use District No. 2
40-X Height and Bulk District
Block/Lot: 0452/ 001-058
Applicant: David Ford
124 Allimore Court
Roseville, CA 95747
Staff Contact Shelley Caltagirone - (415) 558-6625
shelley.caltagirone@sfgov.org
Reviewed By Tina Tam – (415) 558-6325
tina.tam@sfgov.org

1650 Mission St.
Suite 400
San Francisco,
CA 94103-2479

Reception:
415.558.6378

Fax:
415.558.6409

Planning
Information:
415.558.6377

ADOPTING FINDINGS FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR PROPOSED WORK DETERMINED TO BE APPROPRIATE FOR AND CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSES OF ARTICLE 10, TO MEET THE STANDARDS OF ARTICLE 10 AND TO MEET THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR'S STANDARDS FOR REHABILITATION, FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED ON LOTS 001-058 IN ASSESSOR'S BLOCK 0452, WITHIN AN C-2 (COMMERCIAL) ZONING DISTRICT, NORTHERN WATERFRONT SPECIAL USE DISTRICT NO. 2, AND A 40-X HEIGHT AND BULK DISTRICT.

PREAMBLE

WHEREAS, on December 8, 2009, David Ford (Project Sponsor) filed an application with the San Francisco Planning Department (hereinafter "Department") for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the Bank of America signage at the south façade of the Woolen Mill Building.

WHEREAS, the Project was determined by the Department to be categorically exempt from environmental review. The Historic Preservation Commission (hereinafter "Commission") has reviewed and concurs with said determination.

WHEREAS, on February 17 2010, the Commission conducted a duly noticed public hearing on the current project, Case No. 2009.1122A ("Project") for its appropriateness.

WHEREAS, in reviewing the Application, the Commission has had available for its review and consideration case reports, plans, and other materials pertaining to the Project contained in the Department's case files, has reviewed and heard testimony and received materials from interested parties during the public hearing on the Project.

MOVED, that the Commission hereby grants the Certificate of Appropriateness, in conformance with the architectural plans dated received January 27, 2010 and labeled Exhibit B on file in the docket for Case No. 2009.1122A based on the following findings:

FINDINGS

Having reviewed all the materials identified in the recitals above and having heard oral testimony and arguments, this Commission finds, concludes, and determines as follows:

1. The above recitals are accurate and also constitute findings of the Commission.
2. Findings pursuant to Article 10:

The Historical Preservation Commission has determined that the proposed work is compatible with the character of the Alamo Square Historic District as described in Appendix E of Article 10 of the Planning Code.

- That the proposed signage is in keeping with the scale, proportions, materials, and character of the landmark site and with the *Ghirardelli Square Criteria for Minor Tenant Improvements Requiring Landmarks Preservation Advisory Board Approval*, dated November 8, 1989;
- That the proposed installation will not cause the removal or destruction of any significant historic material; and
- That the proposed installation will be undertaken in such a manner that future removal of the signage would cause no impairment to the significance of the resource.
- That the proposal meets the following Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:

Standard 2.

The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

Standard 3.

Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.

Standard 5.

Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.

Standard 9.

New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

Standard 10.

New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

3. **General Plan Compliance.** The proposed Certificate of Appropriateness is, on balance, consistent with the following Objectives and Policies of the General Plan:

I. URBAN DESIGN ELEMENT

THE URBAN DESIGN ELEMENT CONCERNS THE PHYSICAL CHARACTER AND ORDER OF THE CITY, AND THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN PEOPLE AND THEIR ENVIRONMENT.

GOALS

The Urban Design Element is concerned both with development and with preservation. It is a concerted effort to recognize the positive attributes of the city, to enhance and conserve those attributes, and to improve the living environment where it is less than satisfactory. The Plan is a definition of quality, a definition based upon human needs.

OBJECTIVE 1

EMPHASIS OF THE CHARACTERISTIC PATTERN WHICH GIVES TO THE CITY AND ITS NEIGHBORHOODS AN IMAGE, A SENSE OF PURPOSE, AND A MEANS OF ORIENTATION.

POLICY 1.3

Recognize that buildings, when seen together, produce a total effect that characterizes the city and its districts.

OBJECTIVE 2

CONSERVATION OF RESOURCES WHICH PROVIDE A SENSE OF NATURE, CONTINUITY WITH THE PAST, AND FREEDOM FROM OVERCROWDING.

POLICY 2.4

Preserve notable landmarks and areas of historic, architectural or aesthetic value, and promote the preservation of other buildings and features that provide continuity with past development.

POLICY 2.5

Use care in remodeling of older buildings, in order to enhance rather than weaken the original character of such buildings.

POLICY 2.7

Recognize and protect outstanding and unique areas that contribute in an extraordinary degree to San Francisco's visual form and character.

The goal of a Certificate of Appropriateness is to provide additional oversight for buildings and districts that are architecturally or culturally significant to the City in order to protect the qualities that are associated with that significance.

The proposed project qualifies for a Certificate of Appropriateness and therefore furthers these policies and objectives by maintaining and preserving the character-defining features of Ghirardelli Square for the future enjoyment and education of San Francisco residents and visitors.

4. The proposed project is generally consistent with the eight General Plan priority policies set forth in Section 101.1 in that:

A) The existing neighborhood-serving retail uses will be preserved and enhanced and future opportunities for resident employment in and ownership of such businesses will be enhanced:

The proposed project is for a tourist hotel building located within a residential restrict; the proposed project would not have any impact on neighborhood serving retail uses.

B) The existing housing and neighborhood character will be conserved and protected in order to preserve the cultural and economic diversity of our neighborhoods:

The proposed project will strengthen neighborhood character by respecting the character-defining features of Ghirardelli Square in conformance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

C) The City's supply of affordable housing will be preserved and enhanced:

The subject building is a commercial building; the proposed project will have no adverse effect on the City's supply of affordable housing.

D) The commuter traffic will not impede MUNI transit service or overburden our streets or neighborhood parking:

The proposed project will not result in commuter traffic impeding MUNI transit service or overburdening the streets or neighborhood parking.

- E) *A diverse economic base will be maintained by protecting our industrial and service sectors from displacement due to commercial office development. And future opportunities for resident employment and ownership in these sectors will be enhanced:*

The proposed project is for an existing commercial building and would not have any impact on industrial and service sector jobs.

- F) *The City will achieve the greatest possible preparedness to protect against injury and loss of life in an earthquake.*

Preparedness against injury and loss of life in an earthquake is unaffected by the proposed amendments. Any construction or alteration associated would be executed in compliance with all applicable construction and safety measures.

- G) *That landmark and historic buildings will be preserved:*

The proposed project is in conformance with Appendix E of Article 10 of the Planning Code and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

- H) *Parks and open space and their access to sunlight and vistas will be protected from development:*

The proposed project would not impact the City's parks and open space.

5. For these reasons, the proposal overall, is appropriate for and consistent with the purposes of Article 10, meets the standards of Article 10, and the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, General Plan and Prop M findings of the Planning Code.

DECISION

That based upon the Record, the submissions by the Applicant, the staff of the Department and other interested parties, the oral testimony presented to this Commission at the public hearings, and all other written materials submitted by all parties, the Commission hereby **GRANTS Certificate of Appropriateness No. 2009.1122A** attached hereto as "EXHIBIT A" which is incorporated herein by reference as though fully set forth.

APPEAL AND EFFECTIVE DATE OF MOTION: APPEAL: Any aggrieved person may appeal this Motion to the Board of Appeals within fifteen (15) days after the date of this Motion No. 0048. The effective date of this Motion shall be the date of this Motion. For further information, please contact the Board of Appeals in person at 1650 Mission Street, (Room 304) or call 575-6880.

I hereby certify that the Historical Preservation Commission ADOPTED the foregoing Motion on December 16, 2009.

Linda D. Avery
Commission Secretary

AYES: Hasz, Martinez, Matsuda, Wolfram

NAYS: 0

ABSENT: Buckley, Chase, Damkroger

ADOPTED: February 17, 2010