SAN FRANCISCO
PLANNING DEPARTMENT

Historic Preservation Commission

MEMORANDUM

HEARING DATE: DECEMBER 15, 2010

1650 Mission St.
Suite 400
San Francisco,
CA 94103-2479

Reception:
415.558.6378

Fax:
415.558.6409

Planning
Information:
415.558.6377

Date:	December 8, 2007
Project:	Market and Octavia Survey Findings / Work Program
Staff Contact:	Moses Corrette – (415) 558-6295
	moses.corrette@sfgov.org

BACKGROUND

In 2008, the board of Supervisors passed Ordinance 72-08, which added the Market and Octavia Area Plan to the City's General Plan, together with several amendments to the Planning Code. The Ordinance, "Planning Code Amendments to implement the Market and Octavia Area Plan" includes the following adopted provision:

> "[Following] survey adoption, the Department shall present any, if any, proposed, identified, eligible districts as recorded on DPR 523D District Records, and 523A and 523B, individual building inventory forms, to the [Historic Preservation Commission (Commission)]. Upon receipt, the Commission may: (1) initiate formal listing as outlined in Article 10 of the Planning Code; and/or (2) nominate all California or National Register-eligible districts with the California Office of Historic Preservation (OHP)."

DATA PROVIDED

The enclosed CD includes three files containing information from several surveys with final adoption from within the Market and Octavia Area Plan. These include Market and Octavia Plan-Level Survey, Market and Octavia Augmentation Survey, and overlapping portions of both the Inner Mission North Survey, and Automotive Support Structures Survey.

The pdf package named "Market Octavia Area Plan eligible districts" contains the following documented historic districts:

- Duboce Park District
- Duboce Triangle District
- Elgin Park-Pearl St Reconstruction District
- Guerrero Street Fire Line District
- Hayes Valley Commercial District
- Hayes Valley Residential District (with updates)
- Hidalgo Terrace District
- Jessie-McCoppin-Stevenson Reconstruction District
- Ramona Street District
- SF State Teachers College Vicinity Apts District
- Upper Market Commercial District (with update)

The CD also includes a pdf package named "381 Market Octavia DPR 523B forms" containing DPR 523B forms that evaluated 381 individual properties from each of the surveys noted above with properties within the Market and Octavia Plan area.

The third file on the CD named: "23 Properties for Discussion" relates to the Department analysis outlined below. Bookmarks are inserted into the pdf file to assist in review.

DEPARTMENT REVIEW

As a means to start discussion, the Planning Department has reviewed all of the eligible properties, and compiled a list intended to represent a diverse selection of property types, periods, and criteria of significance.

One district, the Duboce Park District, was selected from the several that were documented and adopted as eligible. The Duboce Park Historic District contains at total of 89 properties. 80 of these properties have been identified as contributors, giving the District a remarkably high concentration of significant and intact buildings. There is only one notable intrusion: the Harvey Milk Center for Recreational Arts at the west end of the park, which was constructed well after the period of significance. Construction dates for the vast majority of contributing resources within the District range from ca. 1897 to approximately 1905.

While many were found to be eligible, churches and other religious buildings were excluded to avoid conflicts with RLUIPA and AB133. Additionally, School District properties and Fire Stations were excluded pending future discussions of designation programs by property type with each City Agency utilizing more specific contexts.

Eligible properties were gathered, and sorted into four categories: Residential apartment buildings and hotels; single-family and small flats; commercial, industrial and fraternal; and automotive. Buildings were then sorted by integrity, associations and uniqueness. The resulting list of 23 buildings are the results of these reviews.

Two properties are included for discussion were not evaluated in the survey, but are provided to encourage additional diversity in the discussion. The first is a property identified in the "San Francisco Modern Architecture and Landscape Design 1935-1970" context statement which was funded by a grant from the Office of Historic Preservation, and is to be presented to the HPC for adoption in early 2011. The other was a suggestion of one the City's Preserve America Program partners.

The following pages provide a list of 23 properties selected by the Department to begin the discussion of the Historic Preservation Commission's Work Plan for properties within the Market and Octavia Area Plan, and are not intended to suggest that any property included or excluded should be selected or omitted from the discussion and/or final selection.

Please see the third pdf file on the CD named: "23 Properties for Discussion" to assist in your review.

Property 1

Address:	1693-1695 Market Street
APN:	3504-038
Zoning:	NCT-3 85X
Built Date:	1914
Property Type	Residential Hotel
Adopted Status code:	3CS
Notes:	High-style building, with the four upper floors intact. Designed by C.A. Meussdorffer.

Property 2

Address:	1580-1598 Market
APN:	0836-010
Zoning:	C-3-G 85-R2; VNMDRUSD
Built Date:	1917
Property Type	Apartment building
Adopted Status code:	3CS
Notes:	High-style building, with the five upper floors intact, and where non-original, storefronts are mostly compatible. A model building of what the M&O plan would encourage. Designed by G. Albert Lansburgh.

Property 3

Address:	150 Franklin
APN:	0834-012
Zoning:	C-3-G 85-R2; VNMDRUSD
Built Date:	1912
Property Type	Apartment building
Adopted Status code:	3CS
Notes:	High-style building,, completely intact by master architect August Nordin

Property 4

Address:	1657 Market
APN:	3504-046
Zoning:	NCT-3 85X
Built Date:	1911
Property Type	Residential Hotel
Adopted Status code:	3CS
Notes:	Another high-style residential hotel with good integrity, designed by Hladik and Thayer. (Hladik was a master)

Property 5

Address:	1649-1651 Market

APN:	3504-001
Zoning:	NCT-3 85X
Built Date:	1912
Property Type	Apartment Building
Adopted Status code:	3CS
Notes:	High-style building, with the four upper floors intact. Designed by MacDonald and Applegarth, a respected SF firm.

Property 6

Address:	1670-1680 Market
APN:	0854-005
Zoning:	NCT-3 85X
Built Date:	1923
Property Type	Apartment Building
Adopted Status code:	3CS
Notes:	The Gaffney building designed by Walter C. Falch, is intact, even the storefronts.

Property 7

Address:	1666-1668 Market St
APN:	0854-004
Zoning:	NCT-3 85X
Built Date:	1913
Property Type	Residential Hotel
Adopted Status code:	3CS
Notes:	Unusually styled Colonial Revival apartment building designed by William H. Crim, a native SF architect who also designed commercial buildings and Christian Science churches.

Property 8

Address:	210 Church
APN:	3543-001
Zoning:	UPR MKT NCT 40-X/50/55-X
Built Date:	1920
Property Type	Apartment Building
Adopted Status code:	3CB
Notes:	An anchor building for the large intersection of Market, Church and 14th Streets, apartment building has good integrity, and is also a contributory building to the Upper Market Historic district.

Property 9

Address:	452-454 Ivy
APN:	0807-021

Zoning:	RTO 40-X
Built Date:	1868-1884
Property Type	Single-Family
Adopted Status code:	3CB
Notes:	One of the oldest buildings in the M&O area plan, this residential building maintains good integrity. It is also contributory to the Hayes Valley historic District.

Property 10

Address:	1896 Market
APN:	0871-008
Zoning:	NCT-3 85-X
Built Date:	1899-1906
Property Type	Residential flats
Adopted Status code:	3S
Notes:	This pre-quake survivor, was on the front row of buildings saved, and is placed across the street from one of the 1906 Refugee Camps, as seen in many photos of the period. While the architect is unknown, it is of a high-style.

Property 11

Address:	2173 15th St
APN:	3560-022
Zoning:	RH-2 40X
Built Date:	1875
Property Type	Single Family
Adopted Status code:	3CS
Notes:	Early gothic style cottage with an owner who has expressed an interest in becoming a landmark.

Property 12

Address:	2177 15th St
APN:	3560-021
Zoning:	RH-2 40X
Built Date:	1875
Property Type	Single Family
Adopted Status code:	5S3
Notes:	The second, and adjacent gothic cottage in Duboce triangle, also quite early This example has been altered somewhat.

Property 13

Address:	210 Waller
APN:	0869-001

Zoning:	RTO 40X
Built Date:	1931
Property Type	Apartment Building
Adopted Status code:	3CS
Notes:	High Style Mediterranean Revival, while not the best in the City, is the best in the M&O area. Designed by architect Charles Strothoff, and built for the owner of the Art Tile and Mantle Company, the building features excellent tile work from the early 1930s.

Property 14

Address:	30 Sharon
APN:	3558-044
Zoning:	RTO 40X
Built Date:	1905
Property Type	Single Family
Adopted Status code:	5S3
Notes:	Very intact example of an extravagant transitional Victorian/Edwardian single-family house – presently owned and occupied by the grandson of the original owner. Strong ties with the historic Swedish community.

Property 15

Address:	2168 Market
APN:	3542-017
Zoning:	UPR MKT NCT 40-X/50-X
Built Date:	1907
Property Type	Fraternal Hall
Adopted Status code:	3S (3CB)
Notes:	Swedish-American hall. A stunning building by master architect August Nordin. Recent renovations have been completed, and the owners take great pride in their building. The building is also within the Upper Market Historic District.

Property 16

Address:	2117 Market St
APN:	3543-012
Zoning:	UPR MKT NCT 40-X/50-X
Built Date:	1905
Property Type	Fraternal Hall
Adopted Status code:	3CB
Notes:	the New Era Hall, for rental to groups without their own building - also designed by Master Architect, August Nordin. Located within the Upper Market Historic District.

Property 17

Address:	1 McCoppin
APN:	3513-001
Zoning:	NCT-3 40-X/85-X
Built Date:	1937/1947
Property Type	Public Utility
Adopted Status code:	3CS
Notes:	Telephone Exchange building, with its present façade dating to 1947, shows heavy influence of Timothy Pfleuger, but designed in-house. It is the best example of a terra-cotta façade in the M&O plan area.

Property 18

Address:	1687 Market
APN:	3504-040
Zoning:	NCT-3 85-X
Built Date:	1925
Property Type	Commercial/Industrial
Adopted Status code:	3CS
Notes:	This building is in excellent condition with superb integrity is both a manufacturing plant and retail storefront for the original owner/builder Edward McRoskey Mattress Factory. Designed by Fabre and Hildebrand.

Property 19

Address:	229 Oak
APN:	0838-032
Zoning:	Hayes NCT 40-X
Built Date:	1913
Property Type	Private Fire Co.
Adopted Status code:	3CS
Notes:	A rarity in the City – a private fire dispatch building. The secondary building has been lost since the survey began, but this main building has great integrity and is well cared for.

Property 20

Address:	401 Castro
APN:	3582-071
Zoning:	Castro NC 65B
Built Date:	1901
Property Type	GLBT
Adopted Status code:	N/A
Notes:	For the purposes of advancing the Preserve America grant, we can designate one of the sites identified by our community partner, Cruisin' the Castro, document

the Twin Peaks Tavern as an Article 10 Landmark. Research would need to be completed, as there are no extant records.

Property 21

Address:	55 Fillmore
APN:	0875-001
Zoning:	RTO 40-X
Built Date:	1957
Property Type	Modern Age / Union
Adopted Status code:	N/A
Notes:	The best example of a modernist building in the Plan area. Recommended by the Modern Age context statement, it was designed by Joseph McCarthy, who took part in the 1949 SF Museum of Art exhibition "Domestic Architecture of the San Francisco Bay Region".

Property 22

Address:	300 Grove
APN:	0792-003
Zoning:	NCT-3 65-X
Built Date:	1920
Property Type	Auto Repair
Adopted Status code:	3CS
Notes:	Few eligible buildings evaluated under the Automotive Context are within the M&O area Plan. This is the best of the historic automobile repair shops. Designed by a little known architect, A. Lacy Worswick, it has excellent integrity.

Property 23

Address:	56-70 12th St
APN:	3505-009
Zoning:	NCT-3 85-x
Built Date:	1912
Property Type	Auto Showroom
Adopted Status code:	3CS
Notes:	The second building proposed under the Automotive Context, this is a very early example of a showroom, a use that lasted to 1959. The present façade plastering dates from 1920. The original building was designed by Miller and Colmesnil.