# SAN FRANCISCO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

# **DRAFT Meeting Minutes**

Commission Chambers, Room 400 City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Wednesday, January 15, 2014 12:30 p.m. Regular Meeting

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: Hasz, Hyland, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram

THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER BY PRESIDENT HASZ AT 12:33 p.m.

STAFF IN ATTENDANCE: Jeff Joslin – Director of Current Planning, Kelly Wong, Keith DeMartini, Susan Parks, Aaron Starr, Richard Sucre, Tim Frye - Preservation Coordinator, and Jonas P. Ionin - Commission Secretary.

#### SPEAKER KEY:

- + indicates a speaker in support of an item;
- indicates a speaker in opposition to an item; and
- = indicates a neutral speaker or a speaker who did not indicate support or opposition.

#### A. PUBLIC COMMENT

**SPEAKERS:** 

Katherine Howard, Golden Gate Park Preservation Alliance with the ROSE working group - explained why ROSE (Recreation and Open Space Element) should return to the 1986 ROSE restrictions and hoped the HPC would agendize an item to hear and make comments on ROSE.

#### B. DEPARTMENT MATTERS

#### 1. Director's Announcements

Preservation Coordinator Frye, on behalf of Planning Director Rahaim, would answer questions on the Development Impact Fee increase.

- 2. Mr. Frye reported on past week's events at Planning Commission and staff reports and announcements:
  - Sam Woo Restaurant at 813 Washington Street located in Chinatown Department Staff and an Enforcement Planner conducted a site visit last December. Notice of Violations were filed on the substantial interior work performed without a permit and a Building Permit Application to convert ground floor to retail and upper floors to office have been submitted to the Planning Department for review. ADA upgrades and exterior signage of the building would be submitted at a separate time;
  - Proposed landmark designation for Marcus Bookstore and Jimbo Bob City at 1712
     Fillmore Street was considered and unanimously supported by the Land Use
     Committee at the January 13<sup>th</sup> hearing. The proposed designation will probably be
     heard by the Board of Supervisors (BOS) at their January 28<sup>th</sup> hearing;
  - Ten Mills Act contracts were unanimously approved by the BOS. The BOS's Finance Committee held a special hearing on December 16<sup>th</sup> to consider the contracts and unanimously approved them on December 17th;
  - The Department would present the Certified Local Government Annual Report to the HPC on February 5<sup>th</sup>, and then forward it to the State Office of Historic Preservation (OHP) for review for compliance.
  - On January 8<sup>th</sup>, the Finance Committee of the BOS considered a resolution to authorize the City to sell 1.1 Million gross-square-feet of Transfer Development Right (TDR) from the War Memorial Complex. The item was continued to January 15<sup>th</sup> hearing pending questions raised by Ms. G. G. Platt on how the calculation was determined for the amount of TDR to sell, the process for authorization, and the role of the Planning Department in that process were addressed. Mr. Frye would let the HPC know the outcome of the hearing.

#### C. COMMISSION MATTERS

# 3. ELECTION OF OFFICERS

Pursuant to the Rules and Regulations of the Historic Preservation Commission, Article II, Section 1, the Commission shall-elect a President and Vice-President at the first Regular meeting of the Commission held after the first day of January each year - or may vote to continue this item to a specific date.

**ACTION:** Elected Commissioner Hasz to server as President and Commissioner

Wolfram to serve as Vice President

AYES: Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman Wolfram, Hasz

<u>Draft Meeting Minutes</u> Page **2** of **8** 

4. Appointment of HPC's Architectural Review Committee Members

**President Hasz** appointed Commissioners Wolfram, Hyland and Pearlman as the ARC Committee Members, and himself as the Ex-Officio.

5. HPC 2014 Hearing Schedule

**ACTION:** By voice vote – Adopted as proposed.

#### 6. 2013.1478A

280-284 UNION STREET, north side of Union Street between Sansome and Montgomery Streets (Block 0106/Lots 063-065). Request for Hearing before the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC). The HPC has received a letter from members of the public requesting a hearing on the Planning Department's approval of an Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness (ACOA13.0092) for the property located 280-284 Union Street, located within the Telegraph Hill Landmark District. It is located within a RH-3 (Residential, Three Family) Zoning District, Telegraph Hill-North Beach Residential Special Use District, and 40-X Height and Bulk limit

The HPC may consider the request and schedule the review of the project at a future public hearing. Should the HPC decide not to hear the project, the Department will approve the building permit associated with the above ACOA. Should the HPC decide to hear the project, the Department will not approve the building permit associated with the above ACOA approval until a final decision is made by the HPC.

REQUESTER: Teresa Votruba, represented the Tenants and Owners on Union Street -

related to the HPC various existing building violations and asked Project

Sponsor to provide elevations for this application.

SPONSOR: Melinda Sajapur, from Reuben, Junius and Rose, represented the Project

Sponsor - requested a hearing of the project be denied and the proposed project to move forward as the work is within the scope of work delegated to the staff for the Minor Permit to Alter, and as well as there is no impact

on the historic character of the district.

SPEAKERS: - Monica Kadner, Owner of 282 Union Street - requested that a hearing be

denied;

- Richard Green, Brother of Owner of 280 Union Street - requested the

proposed project to continue;

+ John Votruba, Joint Property Owner of 218 Union Street - urged HPC to

continue with full proceedings.

ACTION: Denied the request for hearing

AYES: Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram, Hasz

# 7. President's Report and Announcements

**President Hasz** asked when would HPC revisit its Rules and Regulation and agreed that Commission Secretary, Mr. Ionin, to prepare a draft and to calendar the item for the HPC to consider.

Draft Meeting Minutes Page **3** of **8** 

#### 8. Consideration of Adoption:

Draft Minutes for the December 4, 2013 – ARC Meeting;

SPEAKERS: None

ACTION: Adopted as corrected to change:

Page 2 and 10, change James McGraffe McGrath;

Page 2, slither slider;

Page 3, Pali- Paley Park; Dow Dallas Museum;

Page 5, Biers to De Beers

Page 8, like an ingenuous a disingenuous argument;

Page 11, a bit on the defense fence

AYES: Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram, Hasz

• Draft Minutes for the December 4, 2013 – Regular Meeting

SPEAKERS: None ACTION: Adopted

AYES: Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram, Hasz

#### 9. Commission Comments & Questions

#### Disclosures

**Commissioner Matsuda** had a meeting with Apple project team last week; and had phone conservation with Supervisor Breed's Office regarding Marcus Bookstore's fundraising to buy back the building. She asked Mr. Frye to relate further information of the fundraising to the other Commissioners. **Mr. Frye** responded that he would get the information and disseminate it to the HPC later.

**Commissioner Hasz** visited the Veterans Memorial Building to understanding light impact on the rooms below.

# Inquiries/Announcements

Commissioner Pearlman commented on an article by the Chronicle last December about a proposed alternate location at the Bill Graham Civic Auditorium for the arena. He was astounded by the remarks made by former Supervisor Quentin Kopp on tearing down the Auditorium, and the public's response from social media blogs agreeing that it should be torn down. He suggested the HPC needs to continue to promote what it does, to educate the public, and to write a letter to the Chronicle, or Quintin Kopp to express their concerns. Commissioner Johns asked about the status of the Realtors' Preservation Training Program that trains realtors to explain preservation to their clients. President Hasz responded that the California Preservation Foundation has the Program infrastructure set up in

<u>Draft Meeting Minutes</u> Page **4** of **8** 

four components. Pacific Union Realty would more than likely launch the Program in March.

# Future Meetings/Agendas.

**Commissioner Matsuda** would like to 1) follow-up the status update on 318 Washington Street, and 2) agendize an informational presentation on the Recreation and Open Space Element brought to the attention to the HPC by Speaker Katherine Howard.

#### D. CONSIDERATION OF ITEMS PROPOSED FOR CONTINUANCE

10. 2013.0628H

(PILAR LAVALLEY: 415/575-9084)

345 STOCKTON STREET (aka 300 POST STREET) - west side of Stockton Street between Post and Sutter Streets, in Assessor's Block 0294, Lot 016. Request for a Permit to Alter to demolish the existing Levi's store building at south end of parcel (300 Post Street) and construct a new two- to three-story building with an L-shaped plan, and to reconfigure and rehabilitate the Grand Hyatt Hotel plaza, including relocating and reinstalling the existing Ruth Asawa fountain. The subject property contains two buildings - the Grand Hyatt Hotel at 345 Stockton Street and the subject building (Levi's store) at 300 Post Street – and is a Category V (Unrated) property in the Kearny-Market-Mason-Sutter Conservation District in a C-3-R (Downtown Retail) District and 80-130-F Height and Bulk District. The project also requires Downtown Project Authorization pursuant to Section 309 of the Planning Code, including findings outlined in the Board File No. 131059 to allow for the demolition and reconstruction of noncomplying floor area, and a Variance from the Street Frontage Transparency requirements of Planning Code Section 145.1(c). The Downtown Project Authorization and Variance requests will be heard by the Planning Commission and Zoning Administrator at a regularly scheduled joint hearing on February 6, 2014.

# (Proposed for Continuance to February 5, 2014)

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve

SPEAKERS: Jason Oringer, representing SEIU (Service Employees International Union)

- in support of the continuance but was concerned that the proposed date is insufficient to consider CEQA at the same time of the project scheduled

for 2/5/14.

ACTION: Continued as proposed to February 5, 2014

AYES: Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram, Hasz

# E. CONSENT CALENDAR

11. 2013.1707A

(KELLY WONG: 415/575-9100)

900 NORTH POINT STREET – north side of North Point Street between Polk Street and Larkin Street, Assessor's Block 0452, Lot 004. **Request for a Certificate of Appropriateness** for the expansion of the existing porch landing constructed for Unit #228 of the Clock Tower Building to meet private usable open space requirements per Section 135 of the Planning Code. The porch was constructed in 2006 and is not historic. The Clock Tower Building is situated within 900 North Point Street and originally constructed in 1859 by

Draft Meeting Minutes Page 5 of 8

Architects William Mooser, Senior and Junior and later renovated and expanded in 1962. The subject property is Landmark No. 30, historically known as Ghirardelli Square. It is located within a C-2 (Community Business) Zoning District, the Waterfront 2 Special Use District, and 40-X Height and Bulk Limit.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve

SPEAKERS: None ACTION: Approved

AYES: Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram, Hasz

MOTION: M-0221

#### F. REGULAR CALENDAR

Item 12 was heard after Item 15

12.

FY 2014-2016 PROPOSED DEPARTMENT WORK PROGRAM - A presentation of the high-level work program activities for the department in FY 2014-2015 and FY2015-2016 based on the current staffing levels in FY 2013-2014, performance measures and proposed dates where budget items will be discussed during the budget process.

Preliminary Recommendation: None – Informational Only

SPEAKERS: Jim Haas, One of the Directors of the Civic Center Community Benefits

District - responded to Item 8, Sustainable Civic Center, of the Proposed Work Program, pushed for the Draft Plan developed in 1998 by Karen [Alcaltur] and Cathy Simon as a template to begin developing a public realm conceptual design plan that would improve the areas around Civic Center's Plaza, Grove and Fulton Streets for the Centennial of Civic Center

in 2015.

ACTION: None - Informational

# 13. 2013.1593L

(SUSAN PARKS: 415/575-9101)

(KEITH DeMARTINI: 415/575-9118)

2 HENRY ADAMS STREET, bound by Division, Henry Adams, Alameda, and Vermont Streets Street; Assessor's Block 3910; Lot 001. Consideration to initiate Landmark designation of 2 Henry Adams Street, historically known as the Dunham, Carrigan, & Hayden Building, as an Article 10 Landmark pursuant to Section 1004.1 of the Planning Code at the request of the property owner. Further consideration by the Historic Preservation Commission and the Board of Supervisors will occur at a future public hearing and will be noticed separately for a future date.

Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Resolution to Initiate

PRESENTER(S): Tim Kelly; Shaun Murphy, Bay West Development; Larry Badiner, Badiner

Urban Planning.

SPEAKERS: None

ACTION: Adopted a Resolution to Initiate

AYES: Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram, Hasz

**RESOLUTION NO: R-728** 

Draft Meeting Minutes Page **6** of **8** 

#### 14. 2013.1663ZM

(AARON STARR: 415/558-6362)

133-135 GOLDEN GATE AVENUE - Amendments to the Zoning Map and Map 1 of Downtown Area Plan, for 133-135 Golden Gate Avenue (APN 0349/12 & 13) [Board File No. 130999]. Ordinance amending Zoning Map ZN01 and Map 1 of the Downtown Area Plan, to rezone the subject property, an Article 10 Landmark Site, from RC-4 to C-3-G in order to provide for eligibility to sell transferable development rights for property at 133-135 Golden Gate Avenue (St. Boniface Church and Rectory); and making environmental findings, and findings of consistency with the General Plan, and the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1.

Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

PRESENTER: Edward Suharski, Fortress Property Group, assists the Group through the

rezoning process - briefed about the Church's financial need to repair and

maintain the 27 hand-painted stain glass windows.

SPEAKERS: None

ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval

AYES: Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram, Hasz

MOTION: R-729

#### 15. 2013.1764A

(RICHARD SUCRE: 415/575-9108)

<u>VETERAN'S BUILDING, 401 VAN NESS AVENUE</u>, located on the southwest corner of McAllister Street and Van Ness Avenue, Assessor's 0786A, Lot 001. **Request for a Certificate of Appropriateness** for replacement of the upper skylights on the angled roof of the north, south and east facades. This project is a revision to the previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness reviewed and approved by the Historic Preservation Commission at its July 18, 2012 Hearing (Case No. 2011.0420A). The subject property is Landmark No. 84 and is also a contributor to the Civic Center Landmark District. It is located within a P (Public) Zoning District, the Civic Center Special Sign District, and OS/96-X Height and Bulk Limit. *Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions* 

PRESENTERS:

**Tara Lamont**, City Project manager for the Veterans Building Seismic Upgrade and Improvement Project - described the three Options, the reasons behind the difficulty of replacing the skylights to their original design conditions, related the change-of-use on the fifth floor by the Opera House, and suggested to cover the skylights with metal panels (Option B) thus achieving the symmetry of the Veterans Building and the Opera House as desired by the original Architect; **Nancy Goldberg**, Preservation Architect - summarized Tara Lamont's presentation and stated the proposed Option B's design would meet the Secretary of Interiors Standards.

SPEAKERS:

= Jerome Sapiro, Jr., on behalf of the SF Posts of the American Legion - requested notice of mock-up presentation be given to the American Legion, the beneficiaries of the Veterans' Building, so they could review and comment on it;

<u>Draft Meeting Minutes</u> Page **7** of **8** 

- + Paul Cox, Vice Chair of the War memorial Commission urged the HPC to support Option B;
- = Jim [Hsieh], Member of the Commission and Executive Director of the Veterans Success Center - related to the HPC that residents of the War Memorial for the last eight months have been conducting their business of assisting and training veterans to gain employment are operating with reduced efficiency in an alternate location. He urged the HPC to move in full speed to get them back to the building;
- = Jim Haas, involved in Civic Center matters corrected that Arthur Brown was the sole designer of the War Memorial and the fact that many historic documents related to the Civic Center suffered from errors and omissions alike. He said, "The importance of Civic Center is not the individual building, it is the complex," and when this case is made clear, dismissing Bill Graham Civic Auditorium by Quentin Kopp might not happen.

ACTION: Approved Option B with Conditions as amended to include a member of

the Veteran's team be invited to review the mock-up.

AYES: Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram, Hasz

MOTION: M-0222

ADJOURNMENT: 3:18 PM

<u>Draft Meeting Minutes</u> Page **8** of **8**