



SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING DEPARTMENT

Certificate of Appropriateness Case Report

HEARING DATE: APRIL 4, 2012

1650 Mission St.
Suite 400
San Francisco,
CA 94103-2479

Reception:
415.558.6378

Fax:
415.558.6409

Planning
Information:
415.558.6377

Filing Date: March 13, 2012
Case No.: **2011.0420A**
Project Address: **VETERANS BUILDING, 401 VAN NESS AVENUE**
Historic Landmark: Landmark No. 84; Civic Center Historic District
Zoning: P (Public) Zoning District
OS/96-X Height and Bulk District
Block/Lot: 0786A/001
Applicant: Tara Lamont, DPW-Bureau of Architecture
30 Van Ness Avenue
San Francisco, CA 94102
Staff Contact Richard Sucre - (415) 575-9108
richard.sucre@sfgov.org
Reviewed By Timothy Frye – (415) 575-6822
tim.frye@sfgov.org

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION

The **VETERANS BUILDING** at **401 VAN NESS AVENUE** is located on a large rectangular parcel at the southwest corner of McAllister Street and Van Ness Avenue (Assessor's Block 0786A Lot 001). Constructed in 1932, the Veterans Building is a four-story, steel-frame and reinforced concrete civic theater and office building designed in a Beaux-Arts architectural style by architects Brown and Bakewell. The Veterans Building, along with the nearly identical San Francisco Opera House and the adjacent Memorial Court, constitute the War Memorial Complex. The Veterans Building features a granite base and steps, terra cotta cladding, terra cotta ornamentation, steel-sash windows, and a leaded copper mansard roof. The Veterans Building contains 230,000 sq ft, and possesses a variety of uses, including a theater (Herbst Theater), reception space (Green Room), meeting space and offices for various veterans organizations (American Legion Post, War Memorial Trust beneficiaries, and other veterans groups), meeting space and offices for various city agencies, art galleries, and a law library (fourth floor). The Veterans Building is Landmark No. 84, and is designated as "contributory" to the Civic Center Historic District, which is listed in Article 10 of the San Francisco Planning Code.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The War Memorial Board of Trustees (Project Sponsor) proposes to rehabilitate, refurbish, and seismically upgrade the Veterans Building. As noted in designating ordinance for the landmark and the surrounding historic district, this Certificate of Appropriateness authorizes the Historic Preservation Commission to review and approve alterations on the exterior. In detail, the exterior would be rehabilitated as follows:

- Cleaning: Cleaning of exterior façade; removal of staining on granite architectural features caused by ferrous and cuprous metals.

- Window Rehabilitation: Rehabilitation of the existing steel-sash windows, including replacement of broken or missing glazing.
- Terra Cotta Repair/Replacement: Repair of the existing terra cotta cladding and features (balustrades, friezes, and balconies), where spalling, cracking and de-bonding is evident. If necessary, replacement terra cotta units shall be manufactured to match the historic terra cotta finish.
- Roof Replacement: Replacement of the existing membrane roof with a new roof membrane, and replacement of the existing lead-coated copper roof panels with new zinc panels.
- Infill Roof Lightwell: Infill of a roof lightwell adjacent to the main skylight through construction of a new steel-frame, new concrete roof slab and new built-up roof.
- Skylight Replacement: Replacement of the existing steel-sash skylights, which are heavily deteriorated, with new aluminum-sash skylights to match. New skylight profiles will match the size and width of historic profiles.
- New Rooftop Equipment: Installation of new energy-efficient rooftop mechanical equipment, in support of the facility modernization/upgrade.

The seismic upgrade and interior alterations do not require Certificate of Appropriateness approval; however, the Historic Preservation Commission will review and forward comments to the War Memorial Board of Trustees for consideration (See Case No. 2011.0420U). In detail, the interior would be rehabilitated as follows:

- Interior Remodeling/Reorganization:
 - *First Floor*: Construction of a museum/gallery for the San Francisco Arts Commission, as well as a new ticket sales center for the theater and a public café; Refurbishment of the Green Room, including restoration of historic finishes, parquet floor, and chandeliers; Upgrade of Herbst Theater, including refurbishment of the stage-level accessible dressing rooms, stage rigging, and controls; Construction of support space for the Herbst Theater, which will include removal of the non-historic seating in the theater, construction of new stage-level accessible dressing rooms, rehearsal and warm up areas, and equipment storage. The public corridor on the west side will be enclosed to accommodate support space for the theater.
 - *Second Floor*: Reconfigure the office and meeting space allocated to the San Francisco Posts of the American Legion, including removal of some interior historic finishes and installation of modern finishes. The majority of the interior historic finishes within the original meeting rooms will be retained, though the elevated platforms will be removed in some of the rooms.
 - *Third Floor*: Relocation of the War Memorial Department to this floor level, and new offices for the Art Commission.

- *Fourth Floor*: Reconfigure the fourth floor to accommodate the San Francisco Opera (rehearsal, production and office space), and construction of a new 300-seat rehearsal/event space and gallery.
- *New Restrooms*: Construction of new restrooms on all four floors and basement level.
- Seismic Upgrade:
 - Addition of concrete shear walls at various locations throughout the building, including the public corridor walls surrounding the Herbst Theatre and at the four main stair wells;
 - Strengthening of the existing concrete stage walls by epoxy injecting cracks and increasing wall thickness by reinforced concrete;
 - Strengthening of existing perimeter walls in northeast and southeast corners of the building by increasing wall thickness with reinforced concrete;
 - Strengthening of diaphragm collectors at all floor levels by adding new steel members;
 - Strengthening of third and fourth floor diaphragm by addition of bracing members;
 - Strengthening of roof diaphragm by addition of bracing members on all four sides of the building and reinforced concrete at local areas;
 - Addition of lateral bracing to the existing plaster ceilings at the Herbst Theatre, the Main Lobby, the main corridors and the Fourth floor;
 - Addition of bracing to hollow clay tile walls;
 - Provision of adequate support of the stone veneer at Herbst Theatre; and
 - Crack repair of walls, floors and the roof through epoxy injection.
- Mechanical, Electrical and Plumbing Upgrades:
 - Upgrades to mechanical (heating, ventilation, air conditioning, fire protection, domestic and drinking water, and computerized building management), electrical (including emergency power supply), and telecommunication cabling systems; and
 - Replacement of two main passenger elevations and renovation of a freight elevator
- Infrastructure: Replacement of attic catwalks and service platform.
- ADA Upgrades: Various improvements to meet Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) compliance, including clarification of path of travel, new drinking fountains and accessible restrooms.
- Hazardous Materials Abatement: Asbestos and lead abatement, where necessary.

OTHER ACTIONS REQUIRED

Proposed work requires a Building Permit.

COMPLIANCE WITH THE PLANNING CODE PROVISIONS

The proposed project is in compliance with all other provisions of the Planning Code.

APPLICABLE PRESERVATION STANDARDS

ARTICLE 10

A Certificate of Appropriateness is required for any construction, alteration, removal, or demolition of a designated Landmark for which a City permit is required. In appraising a proposal for a Certificate of Appropriateness, the Historic Preservation Commission should consider the factors of architectural style, design, arrangement, texture, materials, color, and other pertinent factors. Section 1006.7 of the Planning Code provides in relevant part as follows:

- a) The proposed work shall be appropriate for and consistent with the effectuation of the purposes of Article 10.
- b) For applications pertaining to landmark sites, the proposed work shall preserve, enhance or restore, and shall not damage or destroy, the exterior architectural features of the landmark and, where specified in the designating ordinance pursuant to Section 1004(c), its major interior architectural features. The proposed work shall not adversely affect the special character or special historical, architectural or aesthetic interest or value of the landmark and its site, as viewed both in themselves and in their setting, nor of the historic district in applicable cases.
- c) For applications pertaining to property in historic districts, other than on a designated landmark site, any new construction, addition or exterior change shall be compatible with the character of the historic district as described in the designating ordinance; and, in any exterior change, reasonable efforts shall be made to preserve, enhance or restore, and not to damage or destroy, the exterior architectural features of the subject property which are compatible with the character of the historic district. Notwithstanding the foregoing, for any exterior change where the subject property is not already compatible with the character of the historic district, reasonable efforts shall be made to produce compatibility, and in no event shall there be a greater deviation from compatibility. Where the required compatibility exists, the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness shall be approved.
- d) For applications pertaining to all property in historic districts, the proposed work shall also conform to such further standards as may be embodied in the ordinance designating the historic district.

THE SECRETARY OF THE INTERIOR'S STANDARDS

Rehabilitation is the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features that convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values. The Rehabilitation Standards provide, in relevant part(s):

Standard 1: A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.

The proposed project would retain the subject property's use as a theater and office, and would maintain the area's civic character. The new uses, including the café and event space, will require minimal changes to the character-defining features of the interior, and will not impact any historic fabric.

Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 1.

Standard 2: The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

In general, the proposed project maintains the historic character of the Veterans Building and the surrounding Civic Center Historic District, since many of the alterations are planned for the interior of the Veterans Building and since exterior work is limited to preservation, rehabilitation, and restoration of existing features, such as the steel-sash windows, skylights, and terra cotta. The exterior work will not remove historic materials that characterize the property and district. The exterior work will replace some historic features, including the historic skylights and lead-coated copper roof panels, but the replacement features will be a compatible substitute material and will match in design, color, shape, and profile. Within the interior, the proposed project would largely avoid removal of historic materials, as evidenced by the extensive plan to repair, rehabilitate, and reinstall many of the existing interior features, such as the electrical switches and faceplates, doors and hardware, and light fixtures. The project would impact the configuration of the west end of the first floor corridor, which would be altered to accommodate a larger dressing room and other support spaces for the Herbst Theater. The corridor would be altered in such a manner to be easily reversible, and to maintain a semblance of the building's original layout and finishes.

Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 2.

Standard 3: Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

The proposed project does not involve conjectural alterations to the subject property. In general, all restoration is based upon historic documentation or retained historic features, such as the restoration of the historic light fixtures in the Main Lobby of the Veterans Building.

Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 3.

Standard 4: Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.

The Veterans Building has undergone some alterations, primarily within the interior, since it was constructed in 1932; however, none of the alterations have acquired significance in their own right. In the Herbst Theater, the removal of the non-historic side mezzanine seating does not constitute an alteration that has acquired significance in its own right. These seats were a later alteration to the property constructed in 1978, which is outside the period of significance. Consequently, the proposed project does not involve alterations to the Veterans Building or Civic Center Historic District, which have acquired significance in their own right.

Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 4.

Standard 5: Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of fine craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.

The proposed project would preserve all distinctive materials, features, finishes or construction techniques that characterize the subject property, including the historic interior finishes found within the Herbst Theater, Main Lobby, and first floor corridors. As part of the seismic upgrade, the proposed project would strengthen the existing corridor walls on each of the floors either with concrete shear walls or with hollow clay tile bracing. To accommodate this seismic scheme, the proposed project would remove, catalog, clean and reinstall all significant interior features finishes found on each of the floors, including historic wainscots, base molding, wood office partitions, drinking fountains, telephone closets, doors, etc. For any historic plaster impacted by the seismic scheme, new plaster would be designed to match. In general, removal or impact to significant ornamental features would be avoided by the proposed project. Similarly, gilded features would be re-gilded in-kind to match the original color and luster. To ensure compliance with Standard 5, the project sponsor is working with a qualified professional with experience in historic architecture, who will monitor the preservation and treatment of distinctive features, finishes, construction techniques and fine craftsmanship.

Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 5.

Standard 6: Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacements of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

The proposed project adopts an ethic of repair over replace, and includes repairing exterior features and many of the historic interior features and finishes, including historic trim, doors and hardware, and light fixtures. Since the original architectural drawings and specifications drafted by architect Arthur Brown Jr. in 1932 are available, any restoration work would be guided by appropriate historic documentation. On the exterior, the majority of the deteriorated features, including the steel-sash windows and terra cotta cladding, will be repaired. The proposed project will replace the deteriorated historic steel-frame skylights with new aluminum-sash skylights. These new skylights will match the sash profile, design and configuration of the historic skylights. Similarly, the proposed project will replace the existing historic leaded copper roof panels with new zinc roof panels, which will closely match the design, color and finish of the historic roof panels.

Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 6.

Standard 7: Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

The proposed project includes an extensive cleaning program, which would clean the granite, terra cotta, and bronze elements. For the terra cotta and granite elements, the project specifications identify a chemical treatment (primarily ProSoCo products or mild detergent), mock-up program and call for pressure washing. This cleaning program is sensitive to the historic materials and would not cause damage. For the bronze elements, the project specifications call for use of water, non-ionic detergent, mineral spirits or a mild cleaning solution—all of which would not cause damage to historic materials.

Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 7.

Standard 8: Significant archaeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.

Based upon provided information, the proposed project would involve minimal ground disturbance limited to the superficial re-grading for the sidewalk and the re-paving of the driveway; therefore, no archaeological resources would be impacted.

Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 8.

Standard 9: New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

The proposed project does not involve any new additions. Rather, the proposed project is focused upon the preservation, rehabilitation, and restoration of the Veterans Building through exterior and interior alterations, and a seismic upgrade. The exterior alterations will not destroy any historic materials, features or spatial relationships, and all work on the exterior is in keeping with the Secretary's Standards. The exterior alterations on the roof, including the infill of the roof lightwell adjacent to the main skylight, would not impact any historic materials, nor is this space considered character-defining to the property. Within the interior, the proposed project would impact the west end of the first floor corridor due to the expansion of the Herbst Theater dressing rooms, and the fourth floor law library, which would be converted into an event/auditorium space. In general, these two alterations would be in keeping with the building's historic character, and would maintain the historic finishes and features.

Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 9.

Standard 10: New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

The proposed project includes a seismic upgrade, which is not typically considered a reversible feature. However, this seismic upgrade would be undertaken in a manner that respects the building's historic character and maintains significant interior features. The seismic upgrade would ensure the longevity of the existing building and would address life safety requirements. Other aspects of the project, including enclosing a portion of the first floor public corridor for the new Herbst Theater support spaces, would maintain and preserve the building's historic fabric, and would maintain the essential form and integrity of the subject property and the surrounding historic district. Typically, these new interior alterations are reversible and respect the building's character-defining features. No new additions are planned for the subject property.

Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 10.

Summary: The Department finds that the overall project is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation*.

PUBLIC/NEIGHBORHOOD INPUT

As of March 29, 2012, the Department has not received public correspondence regarding the proposed project.

ISSUES & OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Constructed in 1932 by architects Brown & Bakewell, the Veterans Building and the surrounding San Francisco Civic Center Historic District are significant under National Register Criterion A (Events) and Criterion C (Design/Construction) within the areas of architecture, community planning, politic/government and recreation for its association with Panama-Pacific International Exposition of

1915. Specifically, the San Francisco Civic Center is notable for: the founding of the United Nations; the drafting and signing of the post-WWII peace treaties with Japan; municipal reform movements; post-earthquake reconstruction; early public and city planning; high artistic values as associated with architecture; and one of the finest and most complete manifestations of the "City Beautiful" architectural movement. The period of significance for the district and the subject property ranges from 1913 to 1951.

The character-defining features of the Veterans Building include the features documented as "Very Significant," "Significant" and "Contributing" within the diagrams and matrices produced by Carey & Company within the Appendix of the Historic Structure Report for the Veterans Building (dated January 25, 2012). A copy of the Historic Structure Report is included on the CD provided with the Commissioner packets.

The Department has no issues with the proposed project. As detailed below, the Department does recommend additional conditions on certain elements of the design to ensure compatibility with the building's historic character (see below).

STAFF ANALYSIS

Included as an exhibit are architectural drawings (plans, elevations and sections) of the existing building and the proposed project, as well as structural drawings of the proposed seismic upgrade. Based on the requirements of Article 10 and the *Secretary of Interior's Standards*, staff has determined the following:

Exterior Alterations: The proposed project includes a number of exterior alterations including: a cleaning program; steel-sash window rehabilitation; a terra cotta repair/replacement program; skylight replacement; roof replacement; infill of a roof lightwell; and installation of new rooftop. As noted above, these alterations are consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*, and do not damage or destroy the exterior architectural features of the landmark property, nor do these alterations affect the overall character of the surrounding historic district.

In general, this work will clean, repair or restore the character-defining elements of the exterior, and will preserve and rehabilitate deteriorated features of the landmark. As noted in Carey & Company's Historic Structure Report (HSR; dated January 25, 2012), the Project Specifications (Spec; dated February 3, 2012) and the 50% Schematic Design Architectural Drawings, the Project Sponsor has outlined a program for cleaning, repairing, and restoring exterior architectural features and materials, which is organized and detailed as follows:

- RoofHSR, Page 49-55;
Spec, Section 07 61 00-Zinc Roofing and Coping
- SkylightsHSR, Page 55-58;
Spec, Section 08 63 00-Metal-Framed Skylights
- Terra Cotta.....HSR, Page 60-64;
50% Schematic Arch. Drawings, Sheet B805
Spec, Section 04 21 17-Terra Cotta Restoration;
Spec, Section 04 21 50-Terra Cotta Replacement

- Windows.....HSR, Page 64-67;
Spec, Section 08 51 00-Metal Window Rehabilitation
- Below Grade Spaces and FoundationsHSR, Page 72-75

Additional information on the Project Sponsor's exterior proposal is detailed in the architectural drawings as follows:

- General Info..... Sheet G004; H000
- Damage & Repair Documentation (Plans)..... Sheets H201 thru H244
- Damage & Repair Documentation (Int. Elevations)..... Sheets H300 thru H356
- Site Plan Sheet A101
- Basement Plan thru Roof Plan..... Sheets A200 thru A206
- Roof Plan (Repair) Sheet B106
- Exterior Elevations (East and South) Sheet B201
- Exterior Elevations (North and West) Sheet B202
- Skylight Details..... Sheet B803

As noted in Article 10, Appendix J, Section 9:

(b) For applications pertaining to sites, buildings, structures and objects in the Civic Center Historic District, any alteration, construction, relocation or demolition, shall comply with the standards contained in Section 1017(c), and shall (1) be compatible with respect to height, massing, fenestration, materials, color, texture, detail, style, scale and proportion, signage, landscaping and street furniture which may define the character of the historic district as described in Section 5 of this designating ordinance and in the Civic Center Urban Design Guidelines adopted by the City Planning Commission; and (2) preserve, enhance or restore, and not damage or destroy, the exterior architectural appearance of the subject site, building, structure and object which is compatible with the character of the Historic District.

(d) Treatment of Stone Surfaces. Numerous structures in the Historic District exhibit stone, terra cotta, or brick exterior surfacing. Proposed treatment of said masonry surfaces with any acid wash, sandblasting, high pressure wash or other abrasive methods is discouraged as such abrasive treatments can severely damage historic masonry surfaces.

As noted above, the exterior alterations would preserve, repair and restore character-defining exterior materials, including the terra cotta cladding and the steel-sash windows, and would correct material deficiencies with existing historic fabric by replacing the lead-coated copper roof panels and the steel-frame skylights with compatible substitute materials. These alterations would be consistent with Article 10, Appendix J, Section 9(b) and (d) in the following manner:

- Cleaning: The project specifications for the cleaning of the terra cotta and granite call for a cleaning mock-up to determine the appropriate product, dwell times and pressures. In addition,

bronze elements would be cleaned in place and polished. (See Spec 04 01 25-Masonry Cleaning; Spec 05 01 71-Bronze Maintenance)

Staff Analysis: Staff has determined that this scope for work is appropriate. This treatment would not damage historic materials on the exterior. No abrasive treatments, such as acid washing, sandblasting or high pressure washing, would occur as part of the project.

- **Window Rehabilitation:** The project drawings and specifications call for the rehabilitation of the existing steel-sash windows, which will be repaired and repainted. Work will include: removal of cracked, broken or non-matching glazing, removal of loose paint and corrosion from windows and frames, application of new protective paint coating and sealant, insertion of new glazing (to match original glazing) and glazing compound, and restoration of window operability. (See Spec 08 51 00-Metal Window Rehabilitation; Architectural Drawings, Sheet B804)

Staff Analysis: Staff has determined that this scope for work is appropriate and will assist in repairing the existing deteriorated window frames and sashes. Further, this treatment would not damage the historic materials on the exterior and would assist in preserving a character-defining feature of the building and surrounding historic district. To ensure that work is performed according to the project specifications, staff has provided a condition of approval for additional information on the windows and a window mock-up (see below).

- **Terra Cotta Repair/Replacement:** The project drawings and specifications call for the repair of the existing terra cotta cladding and features (balustrades, friezes, and balconies), where spalling, cracking and de-bonding is evident. If necessary, replacement terra cotta units shall be manufactured to match the historic terra cotta finish. For the terra cotta repair/restoration, work will include: removal of biological growth, securing loose, displaced or cracked terra cotta units, routing and pointing cracks, removal of non-used metal inserts, removal of all loose bisque spalls, removal of non-matching patches and coat repairs, and re-coating non-color-matched patches. For the terra cotta replacement, new terra cotta units would be fabricated based upon the existing terra cotta units. The new terra cotta would be designed to match in exposed color, pattern, texture, shape, size and profile. (See Spec 03 93 00-Concrete Rehabilitation; Spec 04 06 00-Masonry Mortar; Spec 04 10 27-Repointing; Spec 04 21 17-Terra Cotta Restoration; Section 04 21 50-Terra Cotta Replacement; See Architectural Drawings, Sheet B201, B202, B805 and B806)

Staff Analysis: Staff has determined that this scope for work is appropriate and will assist in repairing the existing terra cotta units. This treatment would also appropriately replace severely deteriorated terra units with new, compatible terra cotta units that would match in design, profile, colors, and shape. This treatment would assist in preserving a character-defining feature of the building and surrounding historic district. To ensure that work is performed according to the project specifications, staff has provided a condition of approval for a terra cotta mock-up (see below).

- **Roof Replacement:** The proposed project would the replace the existing membrane roof with a new roof membrane, and would replace the existing lead-coated copper roof panels with new zinc panels. Included within this work is replacement of the steep slope metal roof, the gutter

linings, and the copings and flashings at the parapet, water table and cornices. The project specifications identify terne-coated copper as an alternate to zinc. (See Spec 07 52 16-Styrene-Butadiene-Styrene (SBS) Modified Bituminous Membrane Roofing; Spec 07 61 00 Zinc Roofing and Copings; Architectural Drawings, Sheet B106)

Staff Analysis: Staff has determined that this scope for work is appropriate and will assist in repairing the deteriorated elements of the metal roof. The replacement of the copper roof for a zinc roof is considered an acceptable substitute material, as supported by the National Park Service in Preservation Brief No. 4 – Roofing for Historic Buildings and Preservation Brief No. 16 – The Use of Substitute Materials on Historic Building Exteriors. Further, the replacement zinc roof would match the existing historic copper roof in design, form, surface, texture, and color. This aspect of the project would preserve an important visual characteristic of the building and surrounding historic district.

- Infill Roof Lightwell: The proposed project would infill a roof lightwell, adjacent to the main skylight, with a new steel-frame, new concrete roof slab and new built-up roof. This roof infill would be in support of the reconfiguration/reorganization of the Herbst Theater ancillary spaces. (See Architectural Drawings, Sheet A400)

Staff Analysis: Staff has determined that this scope for work appears appropriate, is not visible from any public right of way, and will not impact any character-defining features on the building's exterior.

- Skylight Replacement: The proposed project would replace the existing steel-sash skylights, which are heavily deteriorated, with new aluminum-sash skylights. These new skylights would match the historic skylights in design, profile, size and scale. Specifically, terne-coated copper custom caps and zinc paneling would be applied over the aluminum skylight frames, in order to maintain the visual appearance of the historic skylights. (See Spec 08 63 00-Metal-Framed Skylights; Architectural Drawings, Sheet B106, B803)

Staff Analysis: Staff has determined that this scope for work is appropriate and will replace a deteriorated feature of the landmark property. The existing skylights are currently deteriorated, and the new skylights will assist in correcting material deficiencies caused by age and weather. The replacement of skylights is acceptable, since the new skylights will match the design, form, surface, texture, and color of the historic skylights. This aspect of the project would preserve an important visual characteristic of the building and surrounding historic district.

- New Rooftop Equipment: The proposed project calls for the installation of new energy-efficient rooftop mechanical equipment, in support of the facility modernization/upgrade. (See Architectural Drawings, Sheet A206, B106)

Staff Analysis: Staff has determined that this scope for work appears appropriate, is not visible from any public right of way, and will not impact any character-defining features on the building's exterior.

Seismic Upgrade/Interior Alterations: The proposed project includes a seismic upgrade and various interior alterations to reconfigure existing offices and accommodate new tenants/uses. This interior work does not require a Certificate of Appropriateness; however, staff has reviewed the interior alterations and seismic upgrade, and finds them compatible with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

The seismic upgrade includes a number of structural upgrades, including construction of new concrete shear walls, strengthening existing concrete walls with epoxy injections, and strengthening diaphragm connectors, among other methods. The seismic upgrade will ensure that the existing building meets current building and safety codes, which will likely lead to the building's longevity during natural disaster. The seismic upgrade will not adversely impact any character-defining features of the subject property or the surrounding historic district, since all removed architectural features will be salvaged and reinstalled back in place, as specified in the Salvage/Protection Plans (See Sheet H000 to H150; Spec 02 42 91-Protection and Salvage of Historic Elements).

Similarly, the interior alterations would maintain nearly all of the building's interior character-defining features, and would better accommodate the new uses and new tenants. The basement level will be primarily used as storage. The first floor will accommodate more public functions, such as a café and a gallery for the Arts Commission. Historic finishes within the remaining offices on the first floor will be salvaged and reinstalled on the second floor. The Herbst Theater renovations will preserve the character-defining features of the theater and the adjacent public corridor, which will be partially closed off to support a new storage room for the adjacent stage. This public corridor will retain its general form and finishes, and will feature a new wall and doorways. Also occurring on the west end of the building are renovations to the existing offices and meeting rooms, which will be converted into a new green room, six new dressing rooms, and a multipurpose/chorus dressing room for the Herbst Theater. The second floor will be reconfigured to better accommodate the functions of the various veterans organizations. In particular, the historic meeting rooms will retain the majority of their historic wood finishes; though the raised platforms in some of the rooms will be removed. On the third floor, which has been severely altered and does not retain much historic fabric, the interior alterations will reconfigure the existing spaces for new offices and conference rooms. Finally, on the fourth floor, the San Francisco Opera will reconfigure the existing space into a new performance/event space, a new education/media room, a costume shop, new offices, and new storage spaces. Any historic features on this level will be retained, including the columns, plaster walls, and historic laylights, which will be re-glazed. At this level, new internal lighting and a new steel frame would be installed at the laylight level. Overall, the interior alterations retain and preserve those important character-defining features of the landmark property in a manner that is consistent with accepted preservation standards.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

To ensure that the proposed work is undertaken in conformance with this Certificate of Appropriateness, staff recommends the following conditions:

1. As part of the Building Permit, the Project Sponsor shall provide a mock-up of the window rehabilitation for review and approval by Planning Department Preservation Staff. The Project Sponsor shall provide additional information on the window rehabilitation, including a detailed

conditions assessment of each window, a window schedule, and appropriate plan details, as determined by staff.

2. As part of the Building Permit, the Project Sponsor shall provide a mock-up of the terra cotta repair for review and approval by Planning Department Preservation Staff. During or prior to the mock-up, the Project Sponsor shall provide glaze samples, which shall match the existing glaze of the historic terra cotta in shade and tone. This sample shall include an accurate range of colors to match the landmark building.

Based on the requirements of Article 10 and the *Secretary of Interior's Standards*, staff has determined that the proposed work will not negatively affect the subject building or surrounding eligible historic district.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW STATUS

The Project received an exemption from the California Environmental Quality Act ("CEQA") as a Class 1 and 31 Categorical Exemption (CEQA Guideline Section 15301(a) and (d), and Section 15331) because the project involves exterior and interior alteration to the existing building and meets the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*.

PLANNING DEPARTMENT RECOMMENDATION

Planning Department staff recommends APPROVAL WITH CONDITIONS of the proposed project as it appears to meet the *Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation* and requirements of Article 10.

ATTACHMENTS

- Draft Motion
- Exhibits, including Parcel Map, Sanborn Map, Zoning Map, Aerial Photos, and Site Photos
- Landmark Designation Ordinance
- Half-Size 50% Schematic Design Architectural Drawings by Department of Public Works-Bureau of Architecture (dated February 3, 2012; Includes General Info & Code; Demolition and Protection; Historic Preservation; Structural; and Building Envelope)
- San Francisco Opera Tenant Improvement, 4th Floor by Mark Cavagnero Associates (dated February 29, 2012)
- CD (with electronic files of: Certificate of Appropriateness Schematic Design Planning Review Presentation (dated April 4, 2012); 50% Schematic Design Architectural Drawings by Department of Public Works-Bureau of Architecture (dated February 3, 2012; Includes Plumbing, Fire Protection, Electrical, Acoustic, Security, Telecom, AV, Theatrical and Vertical Transportation); Historic Structure Report by Carey & Co (dated January 25, 2012); Luminaire Documentation by Auerbach Glasgow and French (dated February 3, 2012); and Project Specifications by Department of Public Works, Building Design and Construction (Dated February 3, 2012)

RS: G:\Documents\Certificate of Appropriateness\2011.0420A Veterans Building\CofA Case Report_401 Van Ness Ave.doc



SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING DEPARTMENT

Historic Preservation Commission Draft Motion

HEARING DATE: APRIL 4, 2012

Filing Date: March 13, 2012
Case No.: **2011.0420A**
Project Address: **VETERANS BUILDING, 401 VAN NESS AVENUE**
Historic Landmark: Landmark No. 84; Civic Center Historic District
Zoning: P Zoning District
OS/96-X Height and Bulk District
Block/Lot: 0786A/001
Applicant: Tara Lamont, DPW-Bureau of Architecture
30 Van Ness Avenue
San Francisco, CA 94102
Staff Contact Richard Sucre - (415) 575-9108
richard.sucre@sfgov.org
Reviewed By Timothy Frye - (415) 575-6822
tim.frye@sfgov.org

1650 Mission St.
Suite 400
San Francisco,
CA 94103-2479

Reception:
415.558.6378

Fax:
415.558.6409

Planning
Information:
415.558.6377

ADOPTING FINDINGS FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR PROPOSED WORK DETERMINED TO BE APPROPRIATE FOR AND CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSES OF ARTICLE 10, TO MEET THE STANDARDS OF ARTICLE 10 AND TO MEET THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR'S STANDARDS FOR REHABILITATION, FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED ON LOT 001 IN ASSESSOR'S BLOCK 0786A, WITHIN THE P ZONING DISTRICT, CIVIC CENTER HISTORIC DISTRICT, AND OS/96-X HEIGHT AND BULK DISTRICT.

PREAMBLE

WHEREAS, on March 13, 2012, Tara Lamont of the City and County of San Francisco Department of Public Works-Bureau of Architecture on behalf of San Francisco War Memorial Board of Trustees (Property Owner) filed an application with the San Francisco Planning Department (Department) for a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations to the subject property located on Lot 001 in Assessor's Block 0786A.

WHEREAS, the Project was determined by the Department to be categorically exempt from environmental review. The Historic Preservation Commission (hereinafter "Commission") has reviewed and concurs with said determination.

WHEREAS, on April 4, 2012, the Commission conducted a duly noticed public hearing on the current project, Case No. 2011.0420A (Project) for its appropriateness.

WHEREAS, in reviewing the Application, the Commission has had available for its review and consideration case reports, plans, and other materials pertaining to the Project contained in the

Department's case files, has reviewed and heard testimony and received materials from interested parties during the public hearing on the Project.

MOVED, that the Commission hereby grants with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness, in conformance with the project information dated February 3, 2012 and labeled Exhibit A on file in the docket for Case No. 2011.0420A based on the following findings:

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

To ensure that the proposed work is undertaken in conformance with this Certificate of Appropriateness, staff recommends the following conditions:

1. As part of the Building Permit, the Project Sponsor shall provide a mock-up of the window rehabilitation for review and approval by Planning Department Preservation Staff. The Project Sponsor shall provide additional information on the window rehabilitation, including a detailed conditions assessment of each window, a window schedule, and appropriate plan details, as determined by staff.
2. As part of the Building Permit, the Project Sponsor shall provide a mock-up of the terracotta repair for review and approval by Planning Department Preservation Staff. During or prior to the mock-up, the Project Sponsor shall provide glaze samples, which shall match the existing glaze of the historic terracotta in shade and tone. This sample shall include an accurate range of colors to match the landmark building.

FINDINGS

Having reviewed all the materials identified in the recitals above and having heard oral testimony and arguments, this Commission finds, concludes, and determines as follows:

1. The above recitals are accurate and also constitute findings of the Commission.
2. Findings pursuant to Article 10:

The Historic Preservation Commission has determined that the proposed work is compatible with the character of Landmark No. 84 and the Civic Center Historic District as described in Article 10 of the Planning Code.

- That the exterior alterations would clean, repair and restore the exterior character-defining elements, and would rehabilitate deteriorated features of the landmark property.
- That the exterior alterations would replace historic materials, including the leaded-copper roof and steel-frame skylights, with compatible substitute materials.
- That the exterior alterations are compatible with the height, massing, fenestration, materials, color, texture, detail, style, scale and proportion of the surrounding Civic Center Historic District.

- That the exterior alterations would preserve, enhance and restore the exterior architectural appearance of the landmark property in a manner that is compatible with the surrounding Civic Center Historic District.
 - That the treatment of the stone surfaces of the landmark property is appropriate and does not damage any historic masonry surfaces, which contribute to the surrounding Civic Center Historic District.
 - That the essential form and integrity of the landmark and its environment would be unimpaired if the alterations were removed at a future date.
 - That the proposal respects the character-defining features of Landmark No. 84.
 - That the proposal respects the character-defining features of the Civic Center Historic District
 - The proposed project meets the requirements of Article 10.
 - The proposed project meets all ten of the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*.
3. **General Plan Compliance.** The proposed Certificate of Appropriateness is, on balance, consistent with the following Objectives and Policies of the General Plan:

I. URBAN DESIGN ELEMENT

THE URBAN DESIGN ELEMENT CONCERNS THE PHYSICAL CHARACTER AND ORDER OF THE CITY, AND THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN PEOPLE AND THEIR ENVIRONMENT.

GOALS

The Urban Design Element is concerned both with development and with preservation. It is a concerted effort to recognize the positive attributes of the city, to enhance and conserve those attributes, and to improve the living environment where it is less than satisfactory. The Plan is a definition of quality, a definition based upon human needs.

OBJECTIVE 1

EMPHASIS OF THE CHARACTERISTIC PATTERN WHICH GIVES TO THE CITY AND ITS NEIGHBORHOODS AN IMAGE, A SENSE OF PURPOSE, AND A MEANS OF ORIENTATION.

POLICY 1.3

Recognize that buildings, when seen together, produce a total effect that characterizes the city and its districts.

OBJECTIVE 2

CONSERVATION OF RESOURCES WHICH PROVIDE A SENSE OF NATURE, CONTINUITY WITH THE PAST, AND FREEDOM FROM OVERCROWDING.

POLICY 2.4

Preserve notable landmarks and areas of historic, architectural or aesthetic value, and promote the preservation of other buildings and features that provide continuity with past development.

POLICY 2.5

Use care in remodeling of older buildings, in order to enhance rather than weaken the original character of such buildings.

POLICY 2.7

Recognize and protect outstanding and unique areas that contribute in an extraordinary degree to San Francisco's visual form and character.

The goal of a Certificate of Appropriateness is to provide additional oversight for buildings and districts that are architecturally or culturally significant to the City in order to protect the qualities that are associated with that significance.

The proposed project qualifies for a Certificate of Appropriateness and therefore furthers these policies and objectives by maintaining and preserving the character-defining features of the Landmark No. 84 and the Civic Center Historic District for the future enjoyment and education of San Francisco residents and visitors.

4. The proposed project is generally consistent with the eight General Plan priority policies set forth in Section 101.1 in that:

- A) The existing neighborhood-serving retail uses will be preserved and enhanced and future opportunities for resident employment in and ownership of such businesses will be enhanced:

The project will not have any impact on any existing neighborhood serving retail uses.

- B) The existing housing and neighborhood character will be conserved and protected in order to preserve the cultural and economic diversity of our neighborhoods:

The proposed project will strengthen neighborhood character by respecting the character-defining features of Landmark No. 84 and the Civic Center Historic District in conformance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

- C) The City's supply of affordable housing will be preserved and enhanced:

The project will have no impact to housing supply.

- D) The commuter traffic will not impede MUNI transit service or overburden our streets or neighborhood parking:

The proposed project will not result in commuter traffic impeding MUNI transit service or overburdening the streets or neighborhood parking.

- E) A diverse economic base will be maintained by protecting our industrial and service sectors from displacement due to commercial office development. And future opportunities for resident employment and ownership in these sectors will be enhanced:

The proposed will not have any impact on industrial and service sector jobs.

- F) The City will achieve the greatest possible preparedness to protect against injury and loss of life in an earthquake.

Preparedness against injury and loss of life in an earthquake is unaffected by the proposed work. Any construction or alteration associated with the project will be executed in compliance with all applicable construction and safety measures.

- G) That landmark and historic buildings will be preserved:

The project as proposed is in conformance with Article 10 of the Planning Code and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

- H) Parks and open space and their access to sunlight and vistas will be protected from development:

The proposed project will not impact the access to sunlight or vistas for parks and open space.

5. For these reasons, the proposal overall, is appropriate for and consistent with the purposes of Article 10, meets the standards of Article 10, and the *Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*, General Plan and Prop M findings of the Planning Code.

DECISION

That based upon the Record, the submissions by the Applicant, the staff of the Department and other interested parties, the oral testimony presented to this Commission at the public hearings, and all other written materials submitted by all parties, the Commission hereby **GRANTS WITH CONDITIONS a Certificate of Appropriateness** for the property located at Lot 001 in Assessor's Block 0786A for proposed work in conformance with the project information dated February 3, 2012, labeled Exhibit A on file in the docket for Case No. 2011.0420A.

APPEAL AND EFFECTIVE DATE OF MOTION: The Commission's decision on a Certificate of Appropriateness shall be final unless appealed within thirty (30) days. Any appeal shall be made to the Board of Appeals, unless the proposed project requires Board of Supervisors approval or is appealed to the Board of Supervisors as a conditional use, in which case any appeal shall be made to the Board of Supervisors (see Charter Section 4.135).

Duration of this Certificate of Appropriateness: This Certificate of Appropriateness is issued pursuant to Article 10 of the Planning Code and is valid for a period of three (3) years from the effective date of approval by the Historic Preservation Commission. The authorization and right vested by virtue of this action shall be deemed void and canceled if, within 3 years of the date of this Motion, a site permit or building permit for the Project has not been secured by Project Sponsor.

THIS IS NOT A PERMIT TO COMMENCE ANY WORK OR CHANGE OF OCCUPANCY UNLESS NO BUILDING PERMIT IS REQUIRED. PERMITS FROM THE DEPARTMENT OF BUILDING INSPECTION (and any other appropriate agencies) MUST BE SECURED BEFORE WORK IS STARTED OR OCCUPANCY IS CHANGED.

I hereby certify that the Historical Preservation Commission ADOPTED the foregoing Motion on April 4, 2012.

Linda D. Avery
Commission Secretary

AYES:

NAYS:

ABSENT:

ADOPTED: April 4, 2012