



SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING DEPARTMENT

Historic Preservation Commission Motion No. 0232

HEARING DATE: AUGUST 6, 2014

1650 Mission St.
Suite 400
San Francisco,
CA 94103-2479

Reception:
415.558.6378

Fax:
415.558.6409

Planning
Information:
415.558.6377

Filing Date: March 11, 2014
Case No.: **2014.0359A**
Project Address: **201 Buchanan Street**
Landmark: **No. 47: The Nightingale House**
Zoning: RTO (Residential, Transit-Oriented)
40-X Height and Bulk District
Block/Lot: 0858 / 002
Applicant: Lido Martocchio
3759 Mission Street
San Francisco, CA 94110
Staff Contact Shelley Caltagirone - (415) 558-6625
shelley.caltagirone@sfgov.org
Reviewed By Tim Frye – (415) 575-6822
tim.frye@sfgov.org

ADOPTING FINDINGS FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR PROPOSED WORK DETERMINED TO BE APPROPRIATE FOR AND CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSES OF ARTICLE 10, TO MEET THE STANDARDS OF ARTICLE 10 AND TO MEET THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR'S STANDARDS FOR REHABILITATION, FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED ON LOT 002 IN ASSESSOR'S BLOCK 0858, WITHIN THE RTO (RESIDENTIAL, TRANSIT-ORIENTED) ZONING DISTRICT AND 40-X HEIGHT AND BULK DISTRICT.

PREAMBLE

WHEREAS, on March 11, 2014, the Lido Martocchio, (Project Sponsor) filed an application with the San Francisco Planning Department (hereinafter "Department") for a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a concrete stair and trash bin storage area at the southwest corner of the property and alter the non-historic sunroom attached at the rear wall of the historic residence.

WHEREAS, the Project was determined by the Department to be categorically exempt from environmental review. The Historic Preservation Commission (hereinafter "Commission") has reviewed and concurs with said determination.

WHEREAS, on August 6, 2014, the Commission conducted a duly noticed public hearing on the current project, Case No. 2014.0359A ("Project") for its appropriateness.

WHEREAS, in reviewing the Application, the Commission has had available for its review and consideration case reports, plans, and other materials pertaining to the Project contained in the Department's case files, has reviewed and heard testimony and received materials from interested parties during the public hearing on the Project.

MOVED, that the Commission hereby grants the Certificate of Appropriateness, in conformance with the architectural plans and specifications labeled Exhibit A on file in the docket for Case No. 2014.0359A based on the following conditions and findings:

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. The project sponsor shall consult with the Department of Building Inspection and the Planning Department to determine if the parapet height requirement may be modified by applying the Historic Building Code. If feasible, the parapet shall be reduced in height.

FINDINGS

Having reviewed all the materials identified in the recitals above and having heard oral testimony and arguments, this Commission finds, concludes, and determines as follows:

1. The above recitals are accurate and also constitute findings of the Commission.
2. Findings pursuant to Article 10:

The Historical Preservation Commission has determined that the proposed work is compatible with the character of the landmark as described in the designation report.

- The project will support the residential use of the building that does not require significant changes to the distinctive elements of the landmark. The proposed stair will provide safe entry and egress from the existing basement-level dwelling unit without compromising the historic character of the landmark site, and the sunroom alterations will improve an existing amenity of the house.
- All aspects of the historic character of the building will be retained and preserved. The overall design and material integrity of the railing will remain intact, and the sunroom alterations will not remove any historic material.
- The proposed concrete stairs will be utilitarian in design and will not mimic any historic features of the landmark.
- The proposed railings and gate will be designed to match the form of the historic railing; however, the new railings and gate will be distinguished by their modern machine finish.
- The alterations to the sunroom will retain the contemporary appearance of this non-historic feature while improving its compatibility with the character of the landmark.

- Alteration of the sunroom will improve the compatibility of the feature with the character of the landmark building.
- All distinctive materials, features, finishes, construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship will be preserved by the proposed project.
- The proposed stair will be located at the far southwest corner of the property in an area that is appropriately distanced from the formal front entry of the historic home.
- The stair will be constructed of concrete, a material used for the historic retaining wall surrounding the property.
- The new iron railing and gate will largely match the design of the historic iron railing so as not to introduce a new and distracting element to the landscape.
- The trash bin storage area will be located in the side wall of the stair so that it does not have a prominent presence when viewed from the street, and the storage door will be wood to match the material of the historic doors on the property.
- None of the alterations to the sunroom will cause the removal or alteration of any historic features at the rear façade, and none of the sunroom alterations will be visible from the public rights-of-way.
- The proposed alterations could be reversed in the future relying upon historic photographs and the building permit record
- That the proposed project meets the following *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*:

Standard 1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.

Standard 2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

Standard 3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

Standard 4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.

Standard 5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.

Standard 9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

Standard 10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

3. **General Plan Compliance.** The proposed Certificate of Appropriateness is, on balance, consistent with the following Objectives and Policies of the General Plan:

I. URBAN DESIGN ELEMENT

THE URBAN DESIGN ELEMENT CONCERNS THE PHYSICAL CHARACTER AND ORDER OF THE CITY, AND THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN PEOPLE AND THEIR ENVIRONMENT.

GOALS

The Urban Design Element is concerned both with development and with preservation. It is a concerted effort to recognize the positive attributes of the city, to enhance and conserve those attributes, and to improve the living environment where it is less than satisfactory. The Plan is a definition of quality, a definition based upon human needs.

OBJECTIVE 1

EMPHASIS OF THE CHARACTERISTIC PATTERN WHICH GIVES TO THE CITY AND ITS NEIGHBORHOODS AN IMAGE, A SENSE OF PURPOSE, AND A MEANS OF ORIENTATION.

POLICY 1.3

Recognize that buildings, when seen together, produce a total effect that characterizes the city and its districts.

OBJECTIVE 2

CONSERVATION OF RESOURCES WHICH PROVIDE A SENSE OF NATURE, CONTINUITY WITH THE PAST, AND FREEDOM FROM OVERCROWDING.

POLICY 2.4

Preserve notable landmarks and areas of historic, architectural or aesthetic value, and promote the preservation of other buildings and features that provide continuity with past development.

POLICY 2.5

Use care in remodeling of older buildings, in order to enhance rather than weaken the original character of such buildings.

POLICY 2.7

Recognize and protect outstanding and unique areas that contribute in an extraordinary degree to San Francisco's visual form and character.

The goal of a Certificate of Appropriateness is to provide additional oversight for buildings and districts that are architecturally or culturally significant to the City in order to protect the qualities that are associated with that significance.

The proposed project qualifies for a Certificate of Appropriateness and therefore furthers these policies and objectives by maintaining and preserving the character-defining features of the landmark for the future enjoyment and education of San Francisco residents and visitors.

4. The proposed project is generally consistent with the eight General Plan priority policies set forth in Section 101.1 in that:

- A) The existing neighborhood-serving retail uses will be preserved and enhanced and future opportunities for resident employment in and ownership of such businesses will be enhanced:

The proposed project is for the rehabilitation of a residential property and will not have any impact on neighborhood serving retail uses.

- B) The existing housing and neighborhood character will be conserved and protected in order to preserve the cultural and economic diversity of our neighborhoods:

The proposed project will strengthen neighborhood character by respecting the character-defining features of the building in conformance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

- C) The City's supply of affordable housing will be preserved and enhanced:

The project will not reduce the affordable housing supply as the existing unit will be retained.

- D) The commuter traffic will not impede MUNI transit service or overburden our streets or neighborhood parking:

The proposed project will not result in commuter traffic impeding MUNI transit service or overburdening the streets or neighborhood parking as it will provide new off-street parking.

- E) A diverse economic base will be maintained by protecting our industrial and service sectors from displacement due to commercial office development. And future opportunities for resident employment and ownership in these sectors will be enhanced:

The proposed will not have any impact on industrial and service sector jobs.

- F) The City will achieve the greatest possible preparedness to protect against injury and loss of life in an earthquake.

Preparedness against injury and loss of life in an earthquake is improved by the proposed work. The work will be executed in compliance with all applicable construction and safety measures.

- G) That landmark and historic buildings will be preserved:

The proposed project is in conformance with Article 10 of the Planning Code and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

- H) Parks and open space and their access to sunlight and vistas will be protected from development:

The proposed project will not impact the access to sunlight or vistas for the parks and open space.

5. For these reasons, the proposal overall, is appropriate for and consistent with the purposes of Article 10, meets the standards of Article 10, and the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, General Plan and Prop M findings of the Planning Code.

DECISION

That based upon the Record, the submissions by the Applicant, the staff of the Department and other interested parties, the oral testimony presented to this Commission at the public hearings, and all other written materials submitted by all parties, the Commission hereby **GRANTS a Certificate of Appropriateness** for the property located at Lot 002 in Assessor's Block 0858 for proposed work in conformance with the renderings and architectural plans labeled Exhibit A on file in the docket for Case No. 2014.0359A.

APPEAL AND EFFECTIVE DATE OF MOTION: The Commission's decision on a Certificate of Appropriateness shall be final unless appealed within thirty (30) days. Any appeal shall be made to the Board of Appeals, unless the proposed project requires Board of Supervisors approval or is appealed to the Board of Supervisors as a conditional use, in which case any appeal shall be made to the Board of Supervisors (see Charter Section 4.135).

Duration of this Certificate of Appropriateness: This Certificate of Appropriateness is issued pursuant to Article 10 of the Planning Code and is valid for a period of three (3) years from the effective date of approval by the Historic Preservation Commission. The authorization and right vested by virtue of this action shall be deemed void and canceled if, within 3 years of the date of this Motion, a site permit or building permit for the Project has not been secured by Project Sponsor.

THIS IS NOT A PERMIT TO COMMENCE ANY WORK OR CHANGE OF OCCUPANCY UNLESS NO BUILDING PERMIT IS REQUIRED. PERMITS FROM THE DEPARTMENT OF BUILDING INSPECTION (and any other appropriate agencies) MUST BE SECURED BEFORE WORK IS STARTED OR OCCUPANCY IS CHANGED.

I hereby certify that the Historical Preservation Commission ADOPTED the foregoing Motion on August 6, 2014.

Jonas P. Ionin
Acting Commission Secretary

AYES: Hasz, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, and Wolfram

NAYS: None

ABSENT: None

ADOPTED: August 6, 2014