



# SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING DEPARTMENT

---

## Historic Preservation Commission Motion No. 0192 Permit to Alter MAJOR ALTERATION

HEARING DATE: MARCH 20, 2013

1650 Mission St.  
Suite 400  
San Francisco,  
CA 94103-2479

Reception:  
**415.558.6378**

Fax:  
**415.558.6409**

Planning  
Information:  
**415.558.6377**

*Hearing Date:* March 20, 2013  
*Filing Date:* November 21, 2012  
*Case No.:* **2012.1440H**  
*Project Address:* **300 Montgomery Street**  
*Category:* Category I (Significant)  
*Zoning:* C-3-O (Downtown-Office)  
300-S Height and Bulk District  
*Block/Lot:* 0260/010  
*Applicant:* David Wessel  
ARG Conservation Services  
Pier 9, The Embarcadero  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
*Staff Contact* Kelly H. Wong - (415) 575-9100  
[kelly.wong@sfgov.org](mailto:kelly.wong@sfgov.org)  
*Reviewed By* Tim Frye - (415) 558-6625  
[tim.frye@sfgov.org](mailto:tim.frye@sfgov.org)

**ADOPTING FINDINGS FOR A PERMIT TO ALTER FOR MAJOR ALTERATIONS DETERMINED TO BE APPROPRIATE FOR AND CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSES OF ARTICLE 11, TO MEET THE SECRETARY OF THE INTERIOR'S STANDARDS FOR REHABILITATION, FOR THE CATEGORY I (SIGNIFICANT) PROPERTY LOCATED ON LOT 010 IN ASSESSOR'S BLOCK 0260. THE SUBJECT PROPERTY IS WITHIN A C-3-O (COMMERCIAL-OFFICE) ZONING DISTRICT AND A 300-S HEIGHT AND BULK DISTRICT.**

### PREAMBLE

WHEREAS, on November 21, 2012, David Wessel of ARG Conservation Services ("Applicant") filed an application with the San Francisco Planning Department ("Department") for a Permit to Alter for an exterior restoration. The subject building is located on Lot 010 in Assessor's block 0260, a Category I (Significant) building historically known as the American National Bank Building and locally designated under Article 11, Appendix A of the Planning Code. Specifically, the proposal includes:

- Replacement of existing terra cotta window lintel units with glass fiber reinforced concrete (GFRC) units.
- Repointing of GFRC units and adjacent terra cotta.

WHEREAS, the Project was determined by the Department to be categorically exempt from environmental review. The Historic Preservation Commission (hereinafter "Commission") has reviewed and concurs with said determination.

WHEREAS, on March 20, 2013, the Commission conducted a duly noticed public hearing on Permit to Alter application No. 2012.1440H ("Project").

WHEREAS, in reviewing the application, the Commission has had available for its review and consideration case reports, plans, and other materials pertaining to the Project contained in the Department's case files, and has reviewed and heard testimony and received materials from interested parties during the public hearing on the Project.

**MOVED**, that the Commission hereby **APPROVES WITH CONDITIONS** the Permit to Alter, in conformance with the architectural plans dated November 21, 2012 and labeled Exhibit A on file in the docket for Case No. 2012. 2012.1440H based on the following findings:

#### **CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL**

- That prior to issuance of the Architectural Addendum, an on-site full scale mock-up of one replacement GFRC unit with approved glaze match installed at one window lintel shall require review and approval by Planning Department Preservation Staff.
- That prior to issuance of the Architectural Addendum, dimensioned elevations, details, and sections showing all profiles and dimensions for the new GFRC units proposed for replacement of deteriorated terra cotta cladding will be forwarded for review and approval by Planning Department Preservation Staff.

#### **FINDINGS**

Having reviewed all the materials identified in the recitals above and having heard oral testimony and arguments, this Commission finds, concludes, and determines as follows:

1. The above recitals are accurate and also constitute findings of the Commission.
2. Findings pursuant to Article 11:

The Commission has determined that the proposed work is compatible with the exterior character-defining features of the subject property and meets the requirements of Article 11 of the Planning Code:

- That the proposal will address water infiltration issues at the building envelope;
- That the new GFRC replacement units will match the existing historic terra cotta in design, color, texture and finish;
- That new GFRC replacement units will be installed only in areas where the existing terra cotta is beyond repair;

- That the proposal respects the character-defining features of the subject building;
- That the architectural character of the subject building will be maintained and that replacement elements will not affect the building's overall appearance;
- That the integrity of distinctive stylistic features and examples of skilled craftsmanship that characterize the building shall be preserved; and,
- That all new materials shall match the historic material in composition, design, color, texture, finish and other visual qualities and shall be based on accurate duplication of features.

For these reasons, the proposal overall, is appropriate for and consistent with the purposes of Article 11, meets the standards of Article 1111.6 of the Planning Code and complies with the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*.

3. **General Plan Compliance.** The proposed Permit to Alter is, on balance, consistent with the following Objectives and Policies of the General Plan:

I. URBAN DESIGN ELEMENT

THE URBAN DESIGN ELEMENT CONCERNS THE PHYSICAL CHARACTER AND ORDER OF THE CITY, AND THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN PEOPLE AND THEIR ENVIRONMENT.

GOALS

*The Urban Design Element is concerned both with development and with preservation. It is a concerted effort to recognize the positive attributes of the city, to enhance and conserve those attributes, and to improve the living environment where it is less than satisfactory. The Plan is a definition of quality, a definition based upon human needs.*

OBJECTIVE 1

EMPHASIS OF THE CHARACTERISTIC PATTERN WHICH GIVES TO THE CITY AND ITS NEIGHBORHOODS AN IMAGE, A SENSE OF PURPOSE, AND A MEANS OF ORIENTATION.

POLICY 1.3

*Recognize that buildings, when seen together, produce a total effect that characterizes the city and its districts.*

OBJECTIVE 2

CONSERVATION OF RESOURCES WHICH PROVIDE A SENSE OF NATURE, CONTINUITY WITH THE PAST, AND FREEDOM FROM OVERCROWDING.

POLICY 2.4

*Preserve notable landmarks and areas of historic, architectural or aesthetic value, and promote the preservation of other buildings and features that provide continuity with past development.*

*POLICY 2.5*

*Use care in remodeling of older buildings, in order to enhance rather than weaken the original character of such buildings.*

*POLICY 2.7*

*Recognize and protect outstanding and unique areas that contribute in an extraordinary degree to San Francisco's visual form and character.*

The goal of a Permit to Alter is to provide additional oversight for buildings and districts that are architecturally or culturally significant to the City in order to protect the qualities that are associated with that significance.

The proposed project qualifies for a Permit to Alter and therefore furthers these policies and objectives by maintaining and preserving the character-defining features of the subject property for the future enjoyment and education of San Francisco residents and visitors.

4. The proposed project is generally consistent with the eight General Plan priority policies set forth in Section 101.1 in that:

- A) The existing neighborhood-serving retail uses will be preserved and enhanced and future opportunities for resident employment in and ownership of such businesses will be enhanced:

*The proposed project will not have an impact on neighborhood serving retail uses.*

- B) The existing housing and neighborhood character will be conserved and protected in order to preserve the cultural and economic diversity of our neighborhoods:

*The proposed project will strengthen neighborhood character by respecting the character-defining features of the building in conformance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards*

- C) The City's supply of affordable housing will be preserved and enhanced:

*The project will not affect the City's affordable housing supply.*

- D) The commuter traffic will not impede MUNI transit service or overburden our streets or neighborhood parking:

*The proposed project will not result in commuter traffic impeding MUNI transit service or overburdening the streets or neighborhood parking. It will provide sufficient off-street parking for the proposed units.*

- E) A diverse economic base will be maintained by protecting our industrial and service sectors from displacement due to commercial office development. And future opportunities for resident employment and ownership in these sectors will be enhanced:

*The proposed project is located on Market Street and will not have a direct impact on the displacement of industrial and service sectors.*

- F) The City will achieve the greatest possible preparedness to protect against injury and loss of life in an earthquake.

*All construction will be executed in compliance with all applicable construction and safety measures.*

- G) That landmark and historic buildings will be preserved:

*The proposed project is in conformance with Article 11 of the Planning Code and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.*

- H) Parks and open space and their access to sunlight and vistas will be protected from development:

*The proposed project will not impact the access to sunlight or vistas for the parks and open space.*

5. For these reasons, the proposal overall, appears to meet the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards* and the provisions of Article 11 of the Planning Code regarding Major Alterations to Category I (Significant) buildings.

**DECISION**

That based upon the Record, the submissions by the Applicant, the staff of the Department and other interested parties, the oral testimony presented to this Commission at the public hearings, and all other written materials submitted by all parties, the Commission hereby **GRANTS a Permit to Alter** for the property located at Lot 010 in Assessor's Block 0260 for proposed work in conformance with the architectural submittal dated November 21, 2012 and labeled Exhibit A on file in the docket for Case No. 2012.1440H.

**APPEAL AND EFFECTIVE DATE OF MOTION: The Commission's decision on a Permit to Alter shall be final unless appealed within thirty (30) days after the date of this Motion No. 0192. Any appeal shall be made to the Board of Appeals, unless the proposed project requires Board of Supervisors approval or is appealed to the Board of Supervisors as a conditional use, in which case any appeal shall be made to the Board of Supervisors (see Charter Section 4.135). For further information, please contact the Board of Appeals in person at 1650 Mission Street, (Room 304) or call (415) 575-6880.**

**THIS IS NOT A PERMIT TO COMMENCE ANY WORK OR CHANGE OF OCCUPANCY UNLESS NO BUILDING PERMIT IS REQUIRED. PERMITS FROM THE DEPARTMENT OF BUILDING INSPECTION (and any other appropriate agencies) MUST BE SECURED BEFORE WORK IS STARTED OR OCCUPANCY IS CHANGED.**

I hereby certify that the Historical Preservation Commission ADOPTED the foregoing Motion on March 20, 2013.

Jonas P. Ionin  
Acting Commission Secretary

AYES: Hasz, Johnck, Johns, Pearlman

NAYS: None

RECUSED: Hyland

ABSENT: Matsuda, Wolfram

ADOPTED: March 20, 2013